UNITED STATES OF AMERICA

DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION

NATIONAL ADVISORY COUNCIL ON INDIAN EDUCATION

WEDNESDAY
APRIL 27, 2022

The Advisory Council met via Video Teleconference, at 1:00 p.m. EST, Deborah Jackson-Dennison, Chairperson, presiding.

PRESENT
DEBORAH JACKSON-DENNISON, Chairperson
THERESA AREVGAAQ JOHN, Member
DOREEN BROWN, Member
ROBIN BUTTERFIELD, Member
AARON PAYMENT, Member
JOELY PROUDFIT, Member
MANDY SMOKER-BROADDUS, Member
VIRGINIA THOMAS, Member
PATRICIA WHITEFOOT, Member
ALSO PRESENT
MIGUEL CARDONA, Secretary, U.S. Department of Education
AMY LOYD, Assistant Secretary for the Office of Career, Technical, and Adult Education, U.S. Department of Education
DONNA SABIS-BURNS, DFO, U.S. Department of Education
JULIAN GUERRERO, U.S. Department of Education
MAHOGANY HOPKINS, LPE Associates
RON LESSARD, U.S. Department of Education
HOLLIE MACKLEY, U.S. Department of Education
(1:12 p.m.)

CHAIR DENNISON: So good morning (Speaking Native language) from the homeland of the San Carlos Apache people. I'm chairing the National Advisory Council on Indian Education, second day, Tuesday, April 26th, 2022 and Wednesday, April 27th, 2022. So I welcome you all to our second day.

We had a very exciting opening day yesterday and I want to thank everyone that has helped to put this together. The contractors that work with us, they're doing a very good job and also our Council members and also all the support staff that are there at the U.S. Department of Education.

Today, we have a pretty -- somewhat lofty agenda and I just want to start with the calling to order by welcoming through introduction and taking roll through introductions of our NACIE members.

We'll start with Aaron, are you here?
MEMBER PAYMENT: Yes. Can you hear me?

CHAIR DENNISON: Yes, Aaron.

MEMBER PAYMENT: Good afternoon, everybody. So glad that we've come back together. I'm Aaron Payment. I'm chairperson of the Sault Ste. Marie Tribe of Chippewa Indians and a team member trying to earn my stripes like the Old Guard.

CHAIR DENNISON: Thank you, Aaron.

Robin?

MEMBER BUTTERFIELD: Oh, good morning, everyone. This is Robin Butterfield. I'm Ho-Chung Anishinaabe. I live in Oregon. Welcome for a second day.

CHAIR DENNISON: Thank you, Robin.

Joely.

MEMBER PROUDFIT: Good morning, everyone. I'm Dr. Joely Proudfit, Payomkawichum from Southern California, and I am Zooming in from the Payomkawichum homeland which is also the campus of Cal State San Marcos. I am the chair
of American Indian Studies here and the Director of the California Indian Culture and Sovereignty Center. Good to be with you all.

CHAIR DENNISON: Thank you, Joely. Doreen.

MEMBER BROWN: Good morning. I'm Doreen Brown. I am the Senior Director for Title 6 Indian Education and Minor Education in Anchorage, Alaska. My mom's family is originally from Aniak and Yu'pik Eskimo and my father is originally from Sedro-Woolley, Washington. Thank you.

CHAIR DENNISON: Thank you, Doreen. Virginia. Virginia, you might be muted still.

ZOOM HOST: Virginia, you may be muted. Please press *6 on your telephone keypad.

MEMBER THOMAS: There you go. This is Virginia Thomas and I'm a member of the Muscogee Creek Nation out of Okmulgee, Oklahoma.

CHAIR DENNISON: Thank you, Virginia. Theresa.

MEMBER JOHN: Thank you, good morning.
I'm a Yu'pik member. I'm calling in from Juneau, a sacred land. Thank you.

CHAIR DENNISON: Thank you, Theresa. I don't know if Pat, you got on, but we'll go with Mandy.

MEMBER SMOKER-BROADDUS: Good morning. My name is Mandy Smoker-Broaddus. I'm a member of the Fort Peck Assiniboine and Sioux Tribes in Montana. I work for Education Northwest which is a nonprofit as a practice expert in Native education.

CHAIR DENNISON: Thank you, Mandy. And did Phyliss get on? I don't see her.

But we do have a quorum, so we will move forward with the agenda. I, myself, am a member, I don't know if I mentioned this if I said it this morning, we're having a conference next door and we have some -- so I just did the opening there, so I don't know if I said it here or there, but it's my privilege to be on the National Advisory Council for Indian Education and we welcome everyone here to listen in and
later on provide comments, if you would like to in the public section of the agenda.

So we will now move on to the topic of overview and recommendations on the Office of Indian Education Activities. So I'll go with --- go ahead.

MEMBER PAYMENT: Dr. D, can I ask a question first?
CHAIR DENNISON: Sure.
MEMBER PAYMENT: So, I see Phyliss. I do think we have a quorum right now.
CHAIR DENNISON: We do.
MEMBER PAYMENT: Okay, good, because Phyliss said that she can come if we need a quorum, otherwise she does have another obligation, but if we need a quorum to let her know.
CHAIR DENNISON: We have reached a quorum.
MEMBER PAYMENT: So, at any point anybody feels like they have to leave, let us know and then we'll try to reach her a little bit
ahead of time to keep a quorum.

CHAIR DENNISON: Yes, and one more order of business pertaining to that. If anyone needs to take a break, put it in the chat, because I'd like to move through the agenda quickly and be able to finish about the same time we did yesterday if that's okay with you all. And just put in -- as long as we're not voting on anything, you can take a break. If you do have to leave, I urge you to please let us know so that we can get somebody else to join like Phyliss. So thank you for that, Aaron.

MEMBER PAYMENT: Okay.

CHAIR DENNISON: I'm going to go ahead and introduce Julian. I yield to Julian. Go ahead, Julian.

MR. GUERRERO: Thank you, Dr. Dennison. I appreciate the opportunity to speak in front of today's Council.

(Native language spoken.)

My name is Julian Guerrero, Jr. I have the pleasure of serving as the Director of
the Office of Indian Education here at the U.S. Department of Ed. And I have quite a few opportunities today to kind of engage with you all on a few topic items that we are looking for recommendations from NACIE on.

Specific to this, I just wanted to underscore that Dr. Dennison's comments yesterday were talking about the importance of resetting the relationship between the Department and NACIE and OIE also is committed to being a part of that collaborative effort. We're committed to a reset. We're committed to embracing what that means and ultimately what that does mean is all of the statutes, making sure that NACIE has the opportunity to comment and have input and help provide advice to the Department. OIE is not the only office that will do this, but OIE wants to be a good leader and lead as a good example for this.

So a few items that I'm going to walk through today are for the Indian Education Professional Development Program in OIE; also,
our Native American Language Program in the OIE; as well as talking through about some recommendations for the FY 2024 departmental budget; as well as seeking recommendations and your input for the formula grant program particular to the Impact Committee work. And then final, last but not least, is getting your input on tribal treaty rights and educational provisions work that we're currently contemplating at the Department and giving your input in advance of a lot of that work.

So starting from the top for the Indian Professional Department Program, the best way I can describe this is that we're looking for input around how we can increase the quality of participation in this program, as well as recruitment. So just for the basics, because I'm going to assume that not every committee member today knows the ins and outs of the PD Program. But to give you a little bit of a background here is that the PD Program is a service payback program. It's awarded on a competitive basis and
the premise of the program is to address the shortage of Native teachers, administrators, and support staff in schools. And the purpose of this program is to increase the number of qualified Indian individuals in professions that serve Indians and to provide training to qualified Indian individuals to become teachers and administrators.

And in order to do this, those individuals who receive training perform work related to the training received under the program and that benefit leads to in a school district that serves a high proportion of Native students or to repay all of their pro-rated part of assistance received under the program.

That's an important piece to mention here is that for the amount of time that a Native scholar receives support and coverage under those grant programs, is the amount of time that they must pay back in service to schools. So we do have instances where scholars do not complete the program and/or do not get placed in a high
density Native school and that doesn't qualify in terms of service payback, so then they would get referred to debt referral.

Another piece of this program is that periodically OIE will report to the Secretary individuals in compliance with the work requirement on their work-related payback. So it's not just truly a grant program. This is a service payback obligation where in order to address the shortage of Native professionals in education, we need to make sure that that service is actually being returned back to the communities that they're serving.

So one of the areas that we wanted to highlight, a problem that we've been seeing and that we want to engage with you on today is that of recruitment. You know, PD, our grant PDs are encountering challenges in recruiting scholars to participate in their program, similar to schools and education at large.

Is NACIE, and this is my first question, is NACIE aware of any successful
recruitment strategies that target Native students at either IHEs or tribal colleges and universities? Like what are some promising practices that are out that you are seeing that may help us in our future efforts to make the PD program even more successful?

And that's a question for the Council and open to the floor right now.

CHAIR DENNISON: Thank you, Julian. So that's a question for all of us that are here. He wants input on this.

I can tell you that one of the programs that I know we created while I was at another school district was to work with the College Teacher Education Program for our Navajo Immersion School that we have that's still there. I don't know if they still have that going, but we were able to provide a place for them to stay while they did their student teaching and it worked out really well. So I don't know if they're still continuing that, but that's just one off the top of my head that I know was an
innovative idea. But that's one area that really lacks.

I know here in San Carlos, it's the same issue where it's not just our immersion, but in other regular content areas, especially special ed and there's some program through the universities that do this type of work, local -- like Arizona State University and we have a program out of the U of A that takes teachers and works with them in trying to get our teacher aides, teacher assistants to become teachers. And those are the kind of programs I'm aware of.

It's just really hard -- it impacts all the other areas because for a high-density school district like San Carlos, it goes back to are we able to provide housing? Are we able to provide -- so that may be one of the shortfalls that happens with if you recruit teachers, unless we grow our own that have homes here already, it's not as effective because there's -- they have to rent homes. We have very limited teacher housing and the conditions aren't as great as we
would like them.

But yes, I think this is huge area to take on, but there's a lot of variables that go along with it. So those are two possible programs that I'm fully aware of. And then we have things from the Department of Ed that I don't know if they're probably connected to your professional development there. I don't know if anybody else has any other ideas of how to share.

But those are some of the dilemmas that we have when we try to say recruitment of teachers and retention of teachers is the quality of life that we can provide in the communities as far as housing.

It really impacts the high-density communities because the reservations, especially with COVID, when the Tribal Council would hold the community and people from the outside couldn't come in. And it was very difficult to even have school, but we had it online. So it helped that we were prepared in that sense, but those are all the situations that we have to deal
with as superintendents.

I know that for high-density schools, we're working on ways to provide more housing so that when we do have these recruitment -- or be able to -- even students that are teacher assistants that are in the school system that may want a home, we're trying to do some kind of partnership with the communities to be able to, if they teach, you know, that's where we could possibly make a connection there. But housing is the biggest issue that prevents us with recruitment and retention.

MEMBER BUTTERFIELD: Julian, this Robin. I had my hand up for a little bit. You know I've had two of my daughters go through the teacher training programs and just from some of the things that they hear from their other cohort members, as well as themselves, one of the issues for getting kids into the program or getting young people into the teacher training program is the guarantee that they will get a job out of it. You know, the programs aren't necessarily
finding them jobs once they graduate. They're sort of left to their own devices.

I know the Portland program in Oregon, at least, has an agreement with the Portland Public Schools, but the program in Eugene, my younger daughter went through that program. They were just kind of left to their own devices.

So I don't know if there's a requirement within the granting cycle that sort of obligates those who receive the funds to help find them jobs afterwards, you know, because they're really intimidated by that payback requirement. And if they can't get a job which was the case a while back, not during the pandemic, but prior to that, you know, they were kind of intimidated in terms of worrying about if they could get a job or not. So that's just one idea. I don't know.

MR. GUERRERO: You make great points.

I thank you so much for that because one of the things that stresses me incredibly is I also care very deeply enough that scholars who do not
complete the program or don't get placed because now that's a debt on them. And we still work with them.

And the hardest thing to do in this position is having to see a name associated with a debt amount because those are real people. They are real relatives of mine who we still have to serve in some capacity. So there is an issue that we must address here.

So this is something that really weighs on me, but we could go all day on that. But I do see another hand -- yes.

MEMBER BUTTERFIELD: I was just going to add to what I had said is that I thought that it's also a requirement that the payback be in specifically high populations of Native student schools. I don't think that's still the case, but to me, we need Native teachers everywhere and they shouldn't penalize if they can only get a job in a district that doesn't have the high percentage of Native students. They're still providing the service to whatever Indian kids are
in the district or that school who are Native, even if it's not 50 percent.

MR. GUERRERO: Sure. And we are making incremental steps to be more flexible and broaden the net for placements and to the identification. So I appreciate you highlighting that because we are cognizant of that issue and thank you, Robin.

I do see two more hands on my screen.

CHAIR DENNISON: Doreen.

MR. GUERRERO: Yes, Doreen.

CHAIR DENNISON: We'll go with Doreen and then Dr. Payment.

MEMBER BROWN: Good morning. Thank you. So one of the things to look at is the urbanization you guys have all mentioned. But one of the things that we looked at when we were going to apply for this grant is we don't have that density. We have 8,000 Native students in our district, but we're a fairly large district, almost 50,000 kids. So they're spread all over. So we didn't have a school that had that -- met
that density piece and you have to think about the urbanization. The bottom line is that we need teachers. We need Native no matter where.

And then the other piece of that is the debt, wow, that we're looking at a program that we can find that don't have those particular chains associated with it, so looking for other programs across the nation through universities or other programming that they can get degrees, masters degrees and such. Thank you.

MR. GUERRERO: Thank you for that.

CHAIR DENNISON: Aaron.

MEMBER PAYMENT: Can you hear me now?

CHAIR DENNISON: Yes.

MEMBER PAYMENT: So I'm glad somebody else spoke because -- so I'm an uncle so I always have to run get kids, so I've got to pick up kids after school today. But I have the same concern. It's one thing to have the scholarship for service, but it's another where they end up it's like a punishment if they don't hire. And here's the thing is with tribal grant schools, with BIE
schools, and then you know, while working for a tribe, there's lots of jobs. Like right now, my education director position is open. And I imagine all kinds of people would want to work in that position so they can work with me. But we pay pretty well. Our education director pay is like $100,000. And it's been vacant for two, almost three years.

So there's a little bit of work that needs to be done. And I don't know if it's maybe a conversation between the scholarship programs and possibly the personnel management and the BIE because Dr. D, you hit the nail right on the head. The biggest challenge for the BIE schools -- not the BIE schools, the Indian -- yes, the BIE schools, not tribal grant schools, is dormitories and residence and all of that.

So it seems like we should be able to have a dialogue across the Department of Ed and Interior, BIE, and then also pull in some personnel management because maybe they've got some ideas about how to warehouse information
about recent graduates. It might be as easy as just matching up the list of recent graduates with the tribes that are looking. So that's it.

MR. GUERRERO: Thank you, Dr. Payment. And then you, Doreen. I appreciate both for that.

And then I see more hands. Dr. Proudfit and Dr. John.

MEMBER PROUDFIT: Yes. Like my colleagues have spoken before, being from California with a population of 40 million and having 307,000 K through 12 teachers and only a little over of those a 1,000 identifying as Native American, we are in desperate need of more Native teachers in this state. But using those kind of numbers and percentages and expectations really works against what we're trying to achieve here. I can tell you Valley Center which is home to many of our sister tribes here, North San Diego County has a 20 percent American Indian student population and has one Native American teacher. So we need more teachers and we need
more teachers to teach in our public schools that 
have ten percent, five percent, three percent 
Native students. It's not just for our Native 
students, but for other non-Native students that 
need to be exposed to quality American Indian 
teachers. So I really want to encourage that 
these considerations -- take into consideration 
what is the reality? And I think all of my 
colleagues who spoke before really underscored 
that this is happening across Indian Country.

MR. GUERRERO: Thank you, Dr. 
Proudfit. Dr. John.

MEMBER JOHN: Yes, good morning. 
Thank you. I was involved in a federal grant, 
second language acquisition teacher education, 
where they recruited four Ph.D. cohorts and 18 
master students. We all were recruited by the 
University of Alaska Fairbanks in 2007 and it was 
a three-year grant under the Alaska Native 
Language Center in Fairbanks.

And all four of our Ph.D. 
students/recruitees have our Ph.D.s now and all
18 master students graduated at the same time. And it was a three-year grant. I graduated in three years with my doctorate degree. But programs like that that go out to rural Alaska to recruit from villages and get advice from village teachers, certified teachers, administrators, those work best. And we definitely need more Native teachers both at the public school level, higher education level.

We lost about five Native professors last year and I think we're two percent Native for the whole UA system and it's over 100 years of existence. And that's not fair.

I believe that with strong strategy for professional development, we would maintain a bank of teachers. We have high, high, high turnovers everywhere, all over. And sometimes, a lot of the recruited come from Lower 48 and they don't know the history of our students, the land, the environment, and they're in a culture shock. It's sad for a lot of them and they don't do well when they're lonely and ill and homesick.
And I agree with everyone's comments earlier. On a personal level, rural students helped me to succeed through my higher education as a first English speaker in my family, as a first student that has experienced federal schools in my history of my people. And so the rural students are assisted very well by lending counseling into understanding that the unique needs of rural students, especially those that have second language issues or multi-cultural status.

We do have a high level of dropouts in our college level as well. So we have to figure something out. Thank you very much.

MR. GUERRERO: I see an additional hand. Mandy.

MEMBER SMOKER-BROADUS: Hi, Julian. Good to see you. I just wanted to let you know for the future that Education Northwest is doing a general landscape analysis of systems and support of all indigenous educators. We're doing that for the Region 16 comprehensive to include a
data analysis of programs that are out there, as well as a lit review and we'll be doing interviews with folks across the country that are in the -- that are running those programs. So that will be available and completed this summer.

MR. GUERRERO: Oh, that's wonderful. Do you know if there's a study of that regarding recruitment of scholars into programs?

MEMBER SMOKER-BROADUS: I'm not entirely sure if that is a component of it, Julian, but I'll look into that and let you know.

MR. GUERRERO: Okay. Thank you. And I have another question also related to the PD program, so for the sake of time, we'll keep it moving to the second question.

CHAIR DENNISON: Before you move on, I'm sorry, Julian, before you move on, I just saw in the chat box from Karen Francis-Begay who is the American Indian -- oh, she works for the University of Arizona as the assistant to the president, I believe, on Indian Affairs. And she provided some links as to the U of A program that
I mentioned.

MR. GUERRERO: Great. Thank you, Dr. Dennison.

CHAIR DENNISON: Okay.

MR. GUERRERO: And I also see a hand up from Virginia.

CHAIR DENNISON: Oh, yes. Virginia has her hand up. Virginia.

MEMBER THOMAS: Can you hear me?

CHAIR DENNISON: Yes, now we can.

MEMBER THOMAS: Okay, good. Thank you. I do have some questions just for my clarification. I am old school. I did come through the American Indian teacher program out of San Diego State in the '70s. That dates me. But I do have two questions and maybe I'm not the only one that's listening to this that needs some clarification. When we talk about the payback, is there a payback extension to where they can go ahead and have an extension on the payback system?

The other one is it also effective
within the BIA schools or BIE schools, as well as public schools for this payback? And would administration jobs that was mentioned earlier, a position had been open for two years, would that be considered towards the payback?

MR. GUERRERO: Thank you for those questions, Virginia. I'll have to take both of those and get back to you. I'll work with my program officer for the PD program and as far as eligibility and making sure that completion is done correctly, we'll make sure to get you a response.

MEMBER THOMAS: Thank you.

CHAIR DENNISON: I don't think we have any hands up, but I'd like to piggyback on her comment because one of the key issues that I've experienced in my career as a superintendent is that we don't have enough indigenous or Native superintendents. We don't have enough Native principals.

And if you're wanting to make change and wanting to implement cultural relevance in
the curriculum and throughout the school system, you really have to have someone that understands that and it's very hard unless you have the leadership, do the Native American language, or whatever we want to do in the school that makes it more conducive to the learning of indigenous children, it lacks largely and that's been my experience is of coming into a school system and have people that didn't believe in that, some of that philosophy. So I just wanted to share that.

It goes back to the question she asked, Virginia asked, about when -- she's wanting to know does that professional development grant allow for leadership as far as administrators as well.

MR. GUERRERO: I know for sure it does on the administration piece.

CHAIR DENNISON: Okay.

MR. GUERRERO: But again, we'll get back to you on the questions.

MEMBER BUTTERFIELD: Yes, I just wanted to let people know that I know of
graduates of some of these programs that have taken over positions like the Director of the Indian Ed program in a school district or a community. And then, NIEA passed a resolution in support of making sure the doctoral programs got funded through the grant and so I think there's been requests over the years for -- it was kind of a Catch-22 for some reason that administrative programs did not get funded and I can't remember what that was, but I know NIEA was in support of trying to make that grant inclusive of people working on principal degrees or superintendent degrees or whatever.

MR. GUERRERO: Thank you for that, Robin. And OIE is aware that there was a resolution passed at NIEA during -- I believe it was in Omaha. And Omaha was where the resolution was passed.

MEMBER BUTTERFIELD: Right, right.

MR. GUERRERO: And that would require a statutory legislative cure. Section 6122(h) of the ESEA requires that a participant perform work
related to the training received. So we don't see a full amount of the K-12 or administrative positions that require a Ph.D., so it appears outside the intent, if not in the scope of the program statute. So we need to fix the statute or the public needs to fix the statute, not so much OIE, but once that gets fixed, OIE can administer to that.

MEMBER BUTTERFIELD: Thanks.

MR. GUERRERO: Yes, absolutely. I don't see any additional hands, but we haven't left the PD program yet. I just have another question regarding the PD program.

The second question is moving on to promising practices that NACIE is aware of in regards to grow your own programs. Here at the Department, there's been a growing interest on tacking on grow your own structures onto the PD program and the OIE is curious and so are others from NACIE on are you aware of any school district that have established any kind of incentive programs to encourage grow your own
Native staff that are seeking teaching or administrator pathways?

CHAIR DENNISON: I'll speak for what I know. I know that there was a large push a few years back, maybe seven or eight years ago now through the Arizona State University here in Arizona -- I know I came through a program like a grow your own from -- through the tribe, a grant with the tribe, and this was way back in the '90s for administrators, for Navajo administrators. And then it carried on from there to Aspire program and I think more recently they had one as well. I know this school district that I'm working in now, in San Carlos, had some teachers that went on and became, got their administrative license and are now working in the school system here.

But other than that, I know that they exist out there and I know we've been really working hard to looking at different avenues. I'm glad to hear that the Department is thinking of this as well. I've talked with several
universities to figure out how we can grow our own internally here. I spoke with -- Prescott College has a possibility and some of the local colleges and universities here are willing to partner, but we just haven't pushed in that direction yet completely with COVID getting in the way which has really put us back a few steps. But we're back getting started again. So that's what I know of.

I know there's been several -- in fact, I got a call not too long ago from one of my colleagues that asked if I knew of any Native superintendents looking for a job and so I just asked him to contact Arizona State University because I know they probably track where all the students went or did they have an administrative certification program or administrative licensure program and Ph.D.s or EDDs. So that's pretty much all the advice I could give them is to go the universities and see where their graduates went.

MR. GUERRERO: Thank you, Dr.
Dennison.

I see a hand from Patricia. And you might be on mute there, Patsy.

CHAIR DENNISON: She's on the phone so she pushes *6.


ZOOM HOST: Patricia, if you've dialed in please press *9 on your telephone keypad so I can identify your line.

MR. GUERRERO: Sorry, it's *9.

ZOOM HOST: I will go ahead and unmute two of the phones I see.

MEMBER WHITEFOOT: Hello, can you hear me?

ZOOM HOST: We can hear you.

MR. GUERRERO: Yes.

MEMBER WHITEFOOT: Okay, I just was sharing that I'm coming to you from the traditional homelands of the Acoma Nation here in the Northwest and I'm also out gathering our traditional foods and medicines with our young students that are with us from the Wapato School
District, a bunch of middle school students who once are out of our homelands are just -- they just are having a wonderful time and I had to leave them just a little while ago.

But as I think about the students that I've been with this morning and I think in how they've come through the tribal system and the public systems, one thing that I saw in terms of professional development and that I was a part of years ago like Virginia, from the 1970s, was through Head Start. And now we haven't kept track of the data on this, but for those paraprofessionals that came to us, parent volunteers through the Head Start program and began working with the Head Start program and again working on their teaching and certification program, they eventually became teachers and/or administrators. And today, they're still in the public school system.

As a matter of fact, I'm one of those individuals that went through the education -- through my own education through that process.
And to me, that's a real holistic approach to learning, not only for the students, but also for paraprofessionals and parents who just begin by volunteering in these programs. The challenge, of course, is that these programs are funded in different agencies.

I want to say I did complete my program through the Teacher Corps program years ago and about 50 percent of my time was in the classroom, not necessarily in a college class by myself, but in the classroom where the students are. And so that, I think, is a model that needs to be considered are the teacher programs, as well as Head Start programs and bringing them together. Yesterday, I spoke to the needs of the whole child and while I was in Teacher Corps program, I was in a classroom where I was working third grade students who were transitioning from Head Start and so the program was modeled after Head Start up to grade three. Now if we ever want to consider a pilot program, I would certainly advocate for something like that for us
to have a program that moves to at least grade three because as we know, that's where the challenges begin is at grade three. I just wanted to share that brief overall vision that I've always for education of our children. Thank you.

MR. GUERRERO: Thank you, Patricia. Any other comments related to the promising practices around grow your own programs that may be of interest for the OIE to consider?

CHAIR DENNISON: I saw a hand up. I don't know where that was.

MR. GUERRERO: Oh, I see. Anna, we'll have public comments towards the end of today's meeting. So if you can just hang tight with us and then we'll get to you. Thank you, Anna.

MEMBER BUTTERFIELD: This is Robin again. I just wanted to sort of piggyback on what Patsy said. I also was a graduate of Teacher Corps and one of successful practices in that program that I observed was that the students didn't just have to go to the
university. The university came out to the communities and worked directly with the teachers on site. And I think that was very helpful because one of the requirements in Teacher Corps was that you also do community work, so they pretty well booked us 100 percent of the time so you were 60 percent in the classroom, I think it was 20 percent on community work, and 20 percent on university work. So there's 100 percent of your time, but they had high expectations that you got to know the community that you were teaching in, and it was too bad they felt like they had too many teachers after a while because there were never too many Native teachers.

MR. GUERRERO: Sure. Thank you, Robin. And we are about up on time, but I did have one final question. This is not particular to recruitment, however this pertains to induction in our PD program.

Is NACIE aware of any promising practices around robust induction service activities that are administered in partnership
between TCUs and school districts?

MEMBER PAYMENT: Can you rephrase that? I'm lost in the jargon.

MR. GUERRERO: The induction services? So we're looking for robust induction service examples that are of interest.

MEMBER PAYMENT: Induction, go back, please. I need a glossary.

CHAIR DENNISON: What do you mean by induction, Julian? Do you mean teacher prep programs at tribal colleges? Is that what you're asking, Julian?

MR. GUERRERO: It's -- so induction activities around placing and preparing the scholar for placement.

MEMBER PAYMENT: Oh, good question.

MEMBER BUTTERFIELD: And specifically through TCUs?

MR. GUERRERO: Correct.

MEMBER PAYMENT: Is Patricia on? She was on earlier. She's with AIHEC.

MEMBER WHITEFOOT: Yes, I'm on.
MEMBER PAYMENT: Are you -- no, not Patsy. Patrese, I'm sorry.

MEMBER WHITEFOOT: Oh, okay.

MEMBER PAYMENT: I got her mixed up with you earlier. You were here, but you weren't here for this. Can we ask Patrese, since she was on the call, if she's still on the call?

MR. GUERRERO: We can if Patrese can wait until public comments, we'll take her during public comments.

MEMBER PAYMENT: Oh, okay, because you're asking us if we're aware of any examples of it and she's with AIHEC, so she's likely to be familiar with it. I know that at Bay Mills Community College for which there's four tribes that are -- four or five tribes that are part of their board of regents, they -- it's not K-12, but they do have early education and they do assist them with placement, so they help them -- they do try to help match. It's more informal. It's not like the -- what's it's called, the alumni office at the college or the placement
office at the college. It's not like that, but it seems there's got to be a couple of tribal colleges that are on top of it. I'm thinking maybe Haskell, may be the one where Leander works. I don't believe that Bay Mills Community College has that or the other two tribal colleges mentioned.

MR. GUERRERO: Sure. No, I appreciate that, Dr. Payment.

CHAIR DENNISON: I'm pretty sure that Diné College has one. I don't know if they go as far as placing them but I do know they have one of the prime areas. Like I said, I would try to recruit from there for the immersion school.

I don't know if it's formalized in a way that you're asking but it goes back to the superintendent or the principal doing recruitment and finding where the sources are such as that.

MR. GUERRERO: Sure. Thank you, Dr. Dennison. Yeah, induction services we're looking for promising practices in terms of -- induction services are professional development for recent
graduates who are new to teaching so we want to make sure that we've got a collection of good strategies, promising strategies there.

CHAIR DENNISON: Well, in the school system I always make it part of the induction program of our new teachers we also have a lot of the former teachers that take this in the beginning.

We have a whole week of induction into the school system using professional development when working without student population. We pay a whole week. It's not a partnership. I know Apache College is getting close to being able to do that but they are not quite there yet.

MR. GUERRERO: Thank you, Dr. Dennison.

MEMBER BUTTERFIELD: Julian, this is Robin again. If you're talking about just preparation, I don't use the word induction but in-service for teachers working with native students, I think a promising practice that no longer exist but was a collaborative between back
when Ed Northwest with Northwest Regional Lab, we partnered with the directors of Indian Education for the states of Oregon, Washington, Idaho, and Montana.

There was another resource center that I think was an equity center that helped us participate. We would put on a summer institute for teachers of native children. They didn't necessarily have to be Native but they had to be working with Native students.

That was life-changing for people who went through that program. That lasted for maybe a half-a-dozen years, that collaborative where all those different agencies came together, you know, paid for the consultants to deliver instruction and talk about community needs and teacher skills.

That's back when the effective practices in Indian education monographs were developed at Northwest Regional Lab so we used some of that content in preparing teachers to be more effective with native children.
MR. GUERRERO: Thank you, Robin. Great. All right. Thank you so much. I believe we've exhausted our time for the PD program. We can now move on to another program that is currently in design. When I mean by design, I truly mean in design. We are brainstorming around how to get this project off the ground.

Just to make the council aware, in the latest fiscal year '22 appropriations in the Consolidated Appropriations Act, the Department received $500,000 to stand up a Native Language Resource center. The Native Language Resource Center is to help be a resource for native language programs across the country.

Not just the native language grant programs in the OIE but across the country. You may have seen some of the news and press releases around this work. The OIE is currently contemplating how to fully implement a Native Language Resource Center in FY '23.

What we're going to do is in the interim from now until the close of the fiscal
year '22 is putting together a plan for how we need to stand up a resource center but we want to make sure that's informed by many stakeholders in the field but definitely this council.

The question I have for the council is when it's a $500,000 budget to stand up the National Native Language Resource Center, what are certain aspect of the resource center that should be included in making this successful?

To give you an idea of what we've thought of so far, we're thinking in terms of implementation laying the groundwork in FY '22 be premised around field engagements. We certainly want to do a tribal consultation.

We would also like to do two targeted listening session opportunities.

We are planning to do a listening session opportunity with specific stakeholder groups such as the National Indian Education Association, the American Indian Language Development Institute, the National Coalition of Native American Language Schools and Programs, as
well as the Joint National Committee for Languages, National Council for Languages and International Studies.

But those are not all-encompassing so we know that there are other targeted organizations who should receive an invitation what might those additional organizations be.

MEMBER PAYMENT: Can you hear me?

MR. GUERRERO: Yes, I can hear you, sir.

MEMBER PAYMENT: All right. So whenever it comes to language, I always default to Leslie Harper from Bug-O-Nay-Ge-Shig School. She's a language medium expert. So there may be some groups there that try to facilitate language revitalization.

In my region we have -- because we're situated at the border of Canada and our language dialect is the same for -- mostly the same for about kind of like a three-state region in Southern Ontario. They do language institutes there.
They do all kinds of sort of curriculum and best practices and all of that. Maybe Anishinaabemowin Teg is the group. We may not know it today but each of us could reach out and see what those groups are.

One other thing that I'll say, and people are probably sick of me talking the ESSA wares but when ESSA was passed we thought really hard and negotiated rulemaking to include provisions for consultation for curriculum, and also for assessment for language.

I don't know if some of the resources could be dedicated to an environmental scan across the states about what's happened so far, if anything at all. I think that's where you're going to find some of the activities that are moving forward in those respective states where they have embraced that.

One of the biggest concerns -- and I had to learn all [of] this from Leslie Harper -- was Puerto Rico as one of our territories, language is allowed to be taught, their native
language. I'm not sure if that's -- this is where my ignorance comes in, if it's Spanish or their indigenous tongue.

They get to evaluate it, the extent of those test scores, evaluate it in its own medium. But for native languages in public schools that might teach the language, that's not permitted in the United States.

We tried really hard on that but the best we could get was consultation. If there is any oversight in the Department of Ed for that part of the implementation of ESSA, that's where you're likely to get some real substantive input about the language of ESSA.

MR. GUERRERO: Thank you, Dr. Payment. We do intend to send an invite to the National Coalition on Native American Language Schools and Programs of which I believe Leslie is the president still.

CHAIR DENNISON: And I'm going to just add to that, again, I don't want to, like Dr. Payment, sound like a broken record but I know
Diné College is where I graduated from and I have a strong connection and a strong bond to the college there, the first tribally-controlled college, the first TCU in the country. They have a native language program.

I'm reading Patrese Atine's chat to everyone that says, "American Indian Higher Education Consortium would like to be involved. We just finished up our first TCU native language submit." So they are doing work at the TCU level for native language acquisition, I guess.

I'm just a strong proponent myself of the immersion concept because I've seen that work and I've seen the data behind that. That's where I really push to get teachers from in the past for the immersion school that can teach in the native language the same concepts that we are learning in the traditional school. I just wanted to add that because I know Patrese put something up there in the chat as well.

MR. GUERRERO: Thank you.

CHAIR DENNISON: Okay.
MR. GUERRERO: I do see additional hands and I don't know who was first. I see Doreen and Dr. Proudfit.

MEMBER BUTTERFIELD: And Robin.

MR. GUERRERO: And Robin.

Doreen. We'll start with you first, Doreen. And then Robin.

MEMBER BROWN: Okay. Thank you. I'm really proud of the fact that we have an immersion of Yu'pik, which is an indigenous language of Alaska, program in Anchorage. I think we are one of the few urban native language immersion schools in our nation.

I'll just let you know that we worked with Avant and we've created a stamp test which is a language proficiency test in reading, writing, listening, and speaking for Yukon. That just started this year. We've been working on it for about a year-and-a-half.

It's aligned with every other language that we teach in our district as well so we worked really hard with that particular testing
company so that we have measures and students have measures of where they are and where they want to be.

We've done a lot of work and we invite anyone to come on up and check out an immersion school because I believe -- I know it's cutting edge and I'm really proud that it's even happening with language because we have 20 indigenous languages in all so even picking one was quite a huge feat and we are having much success. Thank you. I just wanted to share that particular testing avenue.

MR. GUERRERO: Thank you, Doreen.

MEMBER JOHN: She's muted.

MR. GUERRERO: Contractor, could you help unmute Dr. Proudfit?

ZOOM HOST: Could you please raise your hand for me?

MR. GUERRERO: Her hand is raised, Joely Proudfit.

ZOOM HOST: Okay.

I'm asking you to unmute now.
MEMBER PROUDFIT: Thank you. I would encourage us to think broadly about how we can reintroduce language to our homeland for everyone to learn.

You know, we have a wonderful language immersion program in our local tribal communities on our reservation, but we understand and recognize that the majority of native students are in public spaces and places. Public schools, both K through 12, and in higher ed still mandate that they take one of the colonial languages; Spanish, French, German.

These schools exist on tribal lands, on Indian lands. Every school, public school, should be offering the land of the indigenous people where that school resides. I want to encourage us to think more expansively about that.

One of the reasons in higher ed, I'll use my campus as an example, doesn't teach Payomkawichum or Luiseno because they feel that they can't get enough students to take the
language so we send our students to the local community college to take those classes which are offered not as frequently as they would like.

I don't think that helps in preserving or reinstating or relearning our languages when it's happenstance, hit or miss. Since these institutions are benefitting from the very land that they sit on and these very institutions were responsible in the colonial effort to remove our language from our daily use, they should be responsible and encourage that our language remain as a thriving language for our own population.

And also for others who are on our homelands to learn our language. I would like us to think more expansively about how we can re-introduce language to all of the public K through 12 and higher ed spaces. Thank you.

MR. GUERRERO: Thank you, Dr. Proudfit.

And Robin.

MEMBER BUTTERFIELD: Oh, I actually
put a note to everybody just as a reminder that— -- experts at this language revitalization including, you know, taking it to the higher ed level. I'm sure if NIEA is involved, then Native Hawaiians will probably be well represented through that vehicle.

They've kind of set the bar for a lot of indigenous groups in the United States and they base their success on the way the Maoris have revitalized their language. Just looking at the other indigenous practices around the globe, I think, is also helpful.

MR. GUERRERO: Thank you, Robin. I appreciate that.

I also believe I saw your hand, Dr. John.

MEMBER JOHN: (Native language spoken.) I'm just giving you an example of how I became aware as a fluent Yu'pik speaker. I did not know how to write it down until the University of Alaska-Fairbanks developed a writing system by borrowing English letters in
the 1970s.

Today I am very proud of the fact that the university offers Yu'pik degrees and other language degrees that the students can take and bring into the classroom. Yu'pik is the first immersion school in Bethel, Alaska. It was very successful where my younger sister was administrator for 10 years there as well. Now she's the professor at UAA.

The students that graduate from the immersion school are valedictorians and salutatorians. I'm very happy to say that they are increasing the grade levels of immersion school up to middle school and high school in the Bethel area.

As a second language English speaker I am very, very proud of the support of the parents that are making it successful. They bring in things that the students can work on, learn all the internal organs, how to process and harvest, as well as some fish. They take them on berry picking and let them learn how to make
traditional food and understand traditional medicine. Immersion schools work.

I remember when Hawaiians and Maoris came to Bethel to use it as a model to develop their own immersion schools at home. With the support of the parents, nonprofit organizations, Association of Village Council President, and the parent support that bringing students hands-on activities to work on all in the first language. They invite others to come in.

Early in the morning students in Yukon have their indigenous gatherings where they invite indigenous speakers to bring in the Yu'pik systemic values and principles that they can focus on all day long.

The teachers work together to ensure that students have good curriculums and they get involved in summer Yu'pik language development activities that involve certified teachers, teacher aids, university professors, elders. I used to be involved with those the last 20 to 40 years or so.
When there is community effort and when there is funding for the local people to establish strategic plan together, these events do happen. Now I am fluent Yukon writer that I learned in college after being very fluent in Yukon as an undergraduate person. Thank you.

MR. GUERRERO: Thank you, Dr. John Patricia, your hand. You might be on mute there, Patsy.

MEMBER WHITEFOOT: Okay. Can you hear me?

MR. GUERRERO: Yeah, I can hear you now.

MEMBER WHITEFOOT: Okay, great. I agree with what Dr. John shared about the language and how it's so integral to our way of life. As you think about opportunities for getting input, I would strongly recommend that we also have a dialogue with our tribal leaders.

I have found our inter-travel organizations to be those places. When you have it at like the National Congress of American
Indians with a majority of their tribal leaders, you don't often get, you know, all of the recommendations so I would strongly recommend input from our regional organizations as well from our tribal leaders because our languages are very diverse here in the northwest.

Very diverse languages so I think it's important to get a spectrum of our languages. Again, I just want to echo what Theresa said in terms of language acquisition. Thank you.

MR. GUERRERO: Thank you, Patricia. We do intend to do a travel consultation separate from the listening sessions in order to honor responsibility and the engagement with tribal leaders. Thank you for mentioning that.

Okay. We'll move onto the next question that I have. In the design of -- yeah?

MEMBER PAYMENT: Oh, I just wanted to tell you a little -- everybody a funny anecdote. If you heard it already, just laugh like I never told you yet.

When we were doing the negotiated
rulemaking for ESSA, we were really pushing hard.

The two natives in it happened to be two Ojibwes that were assigned to that committee. The rest were superintendents of schools. They had like Exxon Oil people there. I'm like, okay, why are they a constituency here?

But it was a broad base of constituencies of like 21 negotiated rulemakers.

The first day we were trying to emphasize the importance of reviving language to be able to revive culture to build resiliency and for people to withstand historical trauma, etc., etc. It wasn't registering. It wasn't clicking, right? We kept talking about the importance of our language.

Then the next day -- the other thing is it was in the Department of Ed so there was no prayer or anything. It just felt kind of -- to me it didn't feel like we were doing it the right way. I explained in our custom we always like to do a blessing. Not a prayer, separation of church and state, but a blessing. Would you mind
if I do the blessing tomorrow morning? They said, oh, that would be nice.

So I did. I brought some of my sacred items and I did a blessing but I did it all in the language Anishinaabemowin. Then I said, now, by the time we're done, I'm going to evaluate your understanding of the message that I just provided you. You should have saw the look of fear on their faces. That gave us the opportunity to explain the difference in our language and the understanding of our language and then evaluating it through English. That's how we were able to get the consultation requirement in the negotiated rulemaking with tribes so that tribes can weigh in on whether or not the standardized assessments are appropriate for our indigenous languages.

Anyway, we did that. It was kind of fun actually. They had a look of fear on their face that they were going to be evaluated against something they didn't understand. That gave us another opportunity to talk about cultural
competence and about evaluation tools that are not culturally competent for which people of color are evaluated against.

Anyway, a little bit of academic humor.

MR. GUERRERO: Thank you, Dr. Payment.

I do have another question I would like to ask NACIE. If on the lines of one of the other major actions we need to contemplate here is benchmarking this center around other comparable resources that already exist, how can this center add value on top of what already exist out there and/or need a certain niche.

Other comparable resource centers that are out there for native languages, a few colleagues at the department have suggested us looking at the NCELA Center, the National Center for English Language Acquisition, as well as other colleagues across agencies.

There's HHS ANA language demonstration pilot projects that are occurring.

Those might be comparable area to benchmark this
project against. My question to NACIE is do you know -- does NACIE know, or is aware, of any other language centers that we should also include in making sure that we're benchmarking to be an add-on to what exist out there.

Any other centers we should be mindful of?

CHAIR DENNISON: Again, I'm looking at the Karen Francis-Begay. I know that the Indigenous Language Institute is held at the University of Arizona. That would be a great one to have looked at.

MR. GUERRERO: Thank you, Dr. Dennison.

CHAIR DENNISON: Then like Theresa has there's schools all over the country that have really taken on the concept and they send their staff. I know I always send my staff. I sent my staff from San Carlos to Window Rock to see their immersion, both a matter of working between school districts to see what is working in Indian country and to have your staff really see what it
is.

It's really difficult -- even though we have native staff that speak the language, it's really difficult for it to transcend into the way we learn is how we teach sometime so teaching in the native language has been difficult for our staff here.

We just started the immersion with kindergarten, I want to say the year before the pandemic. We were trying to grow each year so it should have been up to like fourth grade by now but we had to stop because of the pandemic. We're at like second grade now. I notice that they don't quite understand the methodologies that need to be used for immersion to be successful.

Those are some of the ideas that I've come up with as a superintendent to help our teachers really understand and know how to implement immersion. I send them to different school districts that have strong immersion schools. That's what I can tell you.
MR. GUERRERO: Thank you, Dr. Dennison.

I do have another question to ask. I know that we're running short on time. We intend to take a break at 2:45 and I want to meet that so everyone can kind of rest a little bit before we come back at 3:00.

My last question for this topic is one of the other components in this work will be making sure that we don't do this in a silo. I think OIE has definitely had enough of doing work in silos so we're going to embrace making sure that we're doing this in a collaborative manner across other federal departments and agencies, those being the Interior, Health and Human Services, Agriculture, Transportation, Library of Media Services, Library of Congress, National Endowment for the Arts, National Endowment for the Humanities, and the list goes on and on. We want to make sure to engage in this war collaboratively across departments.

With that backdrop in mind, what are
certain areas that we should be mindful of as we engage with other departments around this work? Is there anything in particular that NACIE feels we should keep as solid principals as we move forward to contemplate the design of a national native language resource center?

Yes, Virginia, and then Patricia. You might be on mute there, Virginia.

MEMBER THOMAS: I think I'm off mute now.

MR. GUERRERO: Yes, yes. You are.

MEMBER THOMAS: There we go. My only concern with this is that years and years ago we did a collaborative effort among different departments trying to work together for NACIE for issues that were coming up. The only thing that was kind of a hindrance to us at that time was the lack of knowledge from the other departments.

There was no sensitivity. They were not aware that this was an issue because, again, you don't have native people in those positions.

If you're not involved with it on a constant
basis, you don't know what's out there.

If you're going to involve these other departments and other programs that you want to do it, I think that's a wonderful thing but before we drop into this, we need to do some education first.

MR. GUERRERO: Thank you, Virginia. That's very helpful.

Patricia.

MEMBER WHITEFOOT: Can you hear me?

MR. GUERRERO: Yes, we can hear you.

MEMBER WHITEFOOT: Okay. It takes awhile. You have to keep pushing buttons. As you think about working with the other departments, and I agree with Virginia as well that it's important to also provide training and education for the other departments because we all know the role of historical and intergenerational trauma. It's something that is really a challenge for non-native people to understand.

I just completed a training session
around equity and diversity with art educators and it requires ongoing conversations as teachers and educators to understand the importance of native art which uses land-based teachings and the work that gets put into our art endeavors and our work.

Again, what we are doing with our art initiative is also covering the impact of historical trauma and the work that goes on. Just an acknowledgement of that is important. As you move ahead, think about what was in the report. We made reference to it but just a very slight reference to it.

Again, it's important for the other individuals that you'll be working with are in this collaborative effort to at least begin to understand the role of boarding schools, in particular. So it might be that there might be a role for the boarding school initiative as well.

Thank you.

MR. GUERRERO: Here here. Thank you, Patricia.
Any additional comments? We are going to move on to the next item. I'm going to shift around the items just real quick. Let's move down to bullet 4 for OIE Formula Grants, Indian Parent Committee. I believe we can cover that in 15 minutes. We'll take our break and then we'll do our last two items, FY '24 Departmental Budget and Tribal Treaty Rights and Educational Provisions after we come back from break.

In the remaining time, we have for the 15 minutes before break, the Office of Indian Ed has just recently completed the listening session around how we want to support and strengthen parent and family engagement strategies across the nation, particularly how we strengthen the role of Indian parent committees, especially those Indian parent committees who are operating and informing the work of Title VI Formula Grants.

One of the specific areas of supporting this work is making sure that OIE plays a very robust role in giving meaningful
support and services and answers when questions come. My question to NACIE is how can OIE help support the role of Indian parent committees? How does NACIE envision or how should that support look? What would make that meaningful for OIE to do so moving forward?

Dr. Payment, I see your hand.

MEMBER PAYMENT: Yeah. So this is what I testified on in the last couple of years at different consultations. So one of the things that I saw early on that I just took horrible, horrible offense to is -- it was awhile ago now so some of the players are no longer involved.

I won't say what district but -- I mean, I won't name the district but my home district where we're headquartered the school district got very slick about recruiting parents to the parent committee that were also employees of the school district.

My testimony over the last couple of years with reforms of DOM, and Title VI now, have happened. I testified that is a horrible
conflict of interest. The result of it was the funds were either programmed for like crafts with no education, or they were to like pay for a computer lab for delinquent students.

They figured a lot of our kids will cover the computer lab. Or they pay for the delinquency officer with our funds. But they got the support of the parent committee because they were employees of the school district.

But what I think is needed is reform and legislation. But, short of that, would be to build capacity for the parents to understand the empowerment that they can have in advocating for their students and the best interest of the students. A good model for that is Head Start.

So Head Start parent committees are already doing that. The goal and objective for Head Start parent committees is to build the capacity of the parent as well as the child so there's different trainings and in-services. That's what is needed for Title VI is to help build capacity for parents in Title VI.
Oh, also I forgot to say I'm on the parent committee now because I have another child that I'm raising. So building that capacity with parents so that they can effectively advocate and not get sucked into the district just using our Title VI funds to cover stuff that's only tangentially related to the American Indian student. Over and out.

MR. GUERRERO: Thank you, Dr. Payment. Robin.

MEMBER BUTTERFIELD: Yeah. Boy, you hit a nerve here. This is a little bit of background. You know, I did work for Resource Center 3 back when we had our Indian Technical Assistant Centers. One of the biggest areas of need was supporting parent committees because they never really knew how much authority they had around determining, you know, the focus of the program so I concur with everything that Aaron has said.

But in addition to that, I authored the report during the Indian Nations at Risk
commission papers that was focusing on parent engagement. You know, in looking at the research on how "parent engagement/parent involvement" really makes a difference, the more you involve parents in every aspect, whether it's attendance, school achievement, attitude towards school, extra curricula, looking to the future, you know, parents have such a critical role and, yet, historically, you know, we have been intentionally removed from that process.

I think that one of the whole strengths of Indian Ed, Office of Indian Ed, Title IV, V, VI, VII, whatever, has been that it was envisioned that parents would be sort of brought back into the process of being able to have some influence over the education of their children.

The research also says that, you know, the student achievement improves tremendously if parents are given the kinds of skills that are needed to reinforce student learning so strengthening the relationship between the
teacher, the parent, and the child. You know, programs like Family Math, Family Science, Reading Night, you know, where parents are actually learning techniques and skills on how to be supportive of the actual learning of the child. What I see is a whole need for a professional development strand for parents.

You know, the whole notion of parenting because so many of our parents were intentionally removed from the process we need to become more creative on how to re-engage parents.

So many of them think if I push my kid out the door towards the school, I've done my job of being a good parent.

The other issue -- this is a side issue, and you are aware of what's been going on in Portland where the school district -- and this isn't unique to Portland, you know. Many school districts just rubber stamp what they've done the last year and don't really involve the parents.

In Portland they totally shifted where the program was even going to be housed and it
looked like the community was, you know, advocating for the stature of the program to remain important to the district. When it was moved they felt that meant it wasn't.

But they were also told, the parents, that their parent committee composition was not okay. Yet, they had in the bylaws that community representatives were part of the parent committee to include individuals who had previously run the program. I thought that they got advice from your office to sort of kick those people off the parent committee because they did not directly have children in the program anymore.

But the community saw them as valuable assets to the community so I don't know, you know, when the committee develops their parent committee bylaws, that's what the community wants and those should be, you know, largely -- yes, they want parents of children in the program but there's lot of elders and expertise and students that, you know, are interested and involved in the program that provide valuable input.
There's a whole question around the composition, I guess, of the parent committee. But there's another question just around how is that parent committee involved. How is it utilized. What kind of training do they get. How can they be supportive, not just of the program, but of their native children specifically. You know, how you build community.

Also having run up a program, you know, I'm well aware of how difficult it is sometimes to get parents coming. I have all kinds of ideas about strategies for that but it seems like maybe the Office of Indian Ed could develop some guidance like guides for increasing parent engagement, guides for composition of parents, guides for how much authority do you have. That was one of the biggest areas when I worked at the technical assistance that we went out and tried to provide.

MR. GUERRERO: Thank you, Robin. And especially thank you for all your work at PTAC. I know that I've read quite a bit of those
resources, too.

MEMBER BUTTERFIELD: Could I just add one more point, too, because this gets back to my comment yesterday about the needs of parents of children with special needs.

MR. GUERRERO: Absolutely.

MEMBER BUTTERFIELD: There is a highly unmet need on how to work with and support parents who have children with special needs. You can have a whole professional development strand just around, you know, that. Since the Native American Parent Technical Assistance Center was defunded, there is nobody out there providing that kind of support so that would also be another area that would be covered.

MR. GUERRERO: Thank you, Robin.

I see a hand. Is Dr. Payment's hand raised?

CHAIR DENNISON: Yeah, he has his hand raised. I will say something when he's done. I'll wait for him.

MR. GUERRERO: Okay.
MEMBER PAYMENT: Yeah, I appreciate it. It'll be quick. So when I talked about capacity building, to me the very most important thing for skills that a parent should have, or a parent committee can have, in advocating to improve the education experience of their child is to have detailed information about what is retention.

There is way too much local control and that's where school districts are set up and variance across districts about what retention is, the graduation rate, and how to calculate that. You know, if you're not data driven, you can't start from square one which is to give an honest assessment of what your graduation rate is, then you don't have any way to expect benchmarks or interventions to ameliorate that retention statistic.

Just real quickly, the example, again, in my home district is they hired a bunch of brown people and they were proud of themselves for hiring all these brown people, but they were
not credentialed brown people.

They were people that were working in key positions, retention positions, teacher positions, guidance counselor positions, but I guess they thought because they wanted to be affirmatively recruiting natives they didn't have to have the credentials.

Then they were bragging about their increasing graduation number but, you know, anybody with a background in statistics could figure out the proportion of those who were entering that were coming out the other end was not improving. It was getting worse.

The native people that they hired were tokens so they sang the song that the school district wanted sung and it wasn't until I and another person -- this was about 20 years ago -- just kept pushing and pushing and pushing.

There were articles about us in the local paper saying that we hate the district or that we're racist, all this stuff. But we got through all of that and the school district is
now good.

The parents on the parent committee know what a retention statistic is so when the district presents back at the annual meeting for impact aid and they are bragging about all the stuff they do for the Indians, my first question is what is your retention rate.

So that's a key issue -- no, it's a key skill that a parent committee should have so that they don't lead them down this primrose path of all the cultural things in the class and everything is all nice and dandy and everything is good.

That tokenism is just really untenable in this day and age so giving the parents the technical skills they need to be critical and to expect specifics out of the district so that they can advocate for their students. That's it.

MR. GUERRERO: Dr. Dennison and then Dr. John. (Simultaneous speaking.)

CHAIR DENNISON: Yes. And I just really thank Aaron for that because that's one of
the key areas that is so true, especially in public education. And I've heard it from Tribal leaders throughout my career, in my role as chair of NACIE, attending meetings with Tribal leaders.

When people don't know how to do something, they tend to just push it to the wayside or just say we're doing it, but they don't really understand or believe in what they're doing. And that's why, you know, I hounded on the administrators needing to be indigenous to be able to implement and to be able to grasp but even some of our own people are the pushbacks.

So we have our Indian Parent Committee group here, but we went the extra mile, and we've developed -- in fact, that's what's going on right next door is our parent educators that are paid for out of our -- not out of Indian Education, not out of the grant, Formula Grant, but they are paid for out of own budget, whether it's Impact Aid or the state. And they are educating the community about historical trauma,
about -- because that's where the gap lies when you trying to do something that's more relative to our Native children in trying to really push a school system forward and understanding it's that parent knowledge that really lacks.

And the value for education, there's still that mindset out there that, you know, like someone said pushed their kids out the door, and they did their job. And the only time they get involved with the school system is when their children are in trouble, instead of coming to the conference like we're having right now and really taking part and listening to the speakers about not only just historical trauma but also our journey, we call it our (Native language spoken), our journey through Shilgozhoo.

And I just want to say that by doing this, you've elevated the parent community and the Indian education -- Indian Parent Committee, they work together. And it's not just solely -- but it's different for a school system like San Carlos versus even Globe, like 20 minutes down
the road, which is not on an Indian Reservation. But this is a high density school.

So it's working better, but we also have a much greater need. When I got here that was one of the things I recognized from the onset was that the value for education in general has really been -- it was dismal. So really trying to get the parents understanding that this is their school system. It belongs to them. And what we want to teach in our school system is relevant to them as Apache people.

So it's much greater than just the Indian Parent Committee because it's so much -- especially in a high density school system that trying to move the needle, I guess, and we've seen it in our schools where our students themselves are really proud. They did almost like Ph.D. level work at the high school in re-branding the school district with our Shilgozhoo logo.

And they're doing a presentation this afternoon on that very concept of where they got
the information, which Medicine Men they went to and how much input they got from elders in the community to put together the logo with the coordination in combination of indigenous San Carlos Apache wisdom with the standards or the concepts that were required to learn and required to offer and meet in a public education system.

So I'm really proud of our parent educators. We have a parent educator group. Every Wednesday night, each one of the schools has a -- they host a little mini-session. And they have parents coming in, And they do presentations about the different -- like they have the historical -- they have the Museum of San Carlos Apache history.

They do a lot of history teaching. And a lot of the work that's been left out of our school system historically to make the school systems -- felt like more a part of it So many of our teachers went through -- our non-Native teachers went through the program. And they were certified in the concept of being able to teach.
So it's just really become a really big endeavor and very exciting. But that's what we are doing with our Indian education, our San Carlos Apache Parent Education Committee and our parent educators that are employed in the school system working together.

I think it's so important to have in this journey that we're on to right the wrongs that were done in education, in the system of education to our people, for our people. It's really important to get as much as possible, however we do it. Get the parent -- besides just the parent committee, we need more parents involved. And that's where this came from, this idea came from with the parent educators.

And I know some of the other schools have the same thing, but we just really went above and beyond. And I'm really excited about the work they do here. We're just turned on now.

MR. GUERRERO: Thank you, Dr. Dennison. Dr. John and be mindful of the time. We will resume at 3:00 o'clock so now we're
eating away from break. Please, Dr. John.

MEMBER JOHN: Yes. Thank you very much. First of all I would like to say that I agree with the previous colleagues of mine on this topic.

And yesterday we talked a lot about identity, child identity, value of who they are, value of their lines, value of their history, the value of their lands and ecology and spirituality. And when I see the line of Indian parents coming, I ask myself as a Yu'pik woman and as an Eskimo, where is the value in that line of my identity, just to point that out.

I know even in Alaska, we have that issue. There are Inuit Yu'pik Eskimos. There are Southwest Yu'pik Eskimos, and we speak the same language, but our identities are important.

And I don't think I would refer to myself as an Indian because that's not what my parents told me I was or my grandparents and great grandparents.

So first of all, you know, the major
offices, agencies that represent diversity among humanity, I think need, to think about those things, you know, where is my identity?

And as children, the first teachers, the parents have the power. And they have the power to select what they teach them. The first thing is their language and their culture.

And so in schools, I have never heard of the dialogue about the parent rights. Even when I go home and ask the parents, do you know what your rights are, they don't even know that.

And so I think that the first place is to define and identify how much power the indigenous parents have so that they can articulate the importance of decolonizing and indigenizing the curricula to their classrooms not their students because for too long we have lost and felt hurt and pain. This is connected to the trauma issue that my colleagues were talking about, the intergenerational trauma.

So from that trauma, we need to go one more level step forward into healing. With the
COVID going on, our children lost so much class time, so much time to learn from their teachers.

In the village where I'm from, many of the parents were so upset and hurt because they cannot help their students with their homework. They don't know math. They don't know English. They don't know science.

And so when the schools were shut down for months and months and months, I read in social media of the parents crying, of the parents saying I'm failing my child. I'm failing my children. I can't afford to pay for the high cost of internet. I don't have a computer. I can't Zoom with their teachers. And they feel hopeless. And they feel the pain at home. So what does that give us? A home with pain and unsolved healing situations.

I wanted to share, two elders that came to me when I was student teaching in 1990. One was crying. Ten years ago this teacher told me don't ever let them learn your language. You're ruining their class learning. And 10
years later, another teacher came to her, and she said why didn't you teach your children 10 years ago your language and your culture?

And so she was -- the parent was stuck in between the teacher from 10 years ago the instructions and advice and the contemporary teachers saying why didn't you? Your children did not learn your language and your culture.

And another elder from the village told me, I cannot talk to my children in my house because I didn't go to school. They speak a different language now. And their teachers inspired them to use that at home. Not just on that point, but, you know, television and social media in modern life are the forces that are bringing in, you know, different scenarios.

But the point I want to make is that I think that we as educators and those that are affiliated with relatives that are in the COVID state yet, they haven't grieved. They haven't buried their loved ones yet. And their minds are hurting so their children's minds are going to
hurt as well.

What are the teachers doing about that in the classroom right now? How is it going to look like to heal the mind of a child from mind, body and soul all together?

We talk about holistic upbringing in indigenous communities. We are in charge of teaching all of our children their language, their culture, their philosophies, their science, their engineers, their ecology, their oncology, their systemology.

So we are in a -- we are doing a very good job talking about it. I am so happy. I am so, so happy from the bottom of my heart. We are going to make some changes. And I'm so happy that you're here asking us very critical questions that will put us into a positive forward movement of where we can identify a partnership with parents, with teachers, with scholars, with local experts, shamans, healers, you know, whoever.

So I think we need to develop a
healing program at home and in school and in Tribes to deal with things. Because I'm getting phone calls even from adults. Even from my P&C student this morning. She said I don't have time to grieve. Two years ago I started losing my friends. I feel like I'm the only one left. What do I do? I still have to take classes. I haven't talk to the relatives.

So we are all in the same position. We need to look at healing within ourselves, within our homes, within our communities to develop good healing relationships with other agencies like the schools and the council, the local council or whatever.

And I think that, you know, bringing back our indigenous songs and dances and our indigenous healing methodologies are the first place to start because our ancestors are waiting for us. Our ancestors are reaching out to us. They want us to heal. They want us to fill that relationship with them again so that we can proceed into a better, positive outlook for all
CHAIR DENNISON: Yes. Thank you, Dr. John. You just hit it right on for so many of our people, including myself, you know. I haven't even had time. We didn't get to bury. We didn't get to do all of these things. We're all, and I know people in my own family that are adults, and they're still suffering from what we've been through. And it's probably going to be like that for a very long time.

And I know kids in our school system. I just heard one this morning as well talk about how he lost his grandpa to COVID. And it felt like they never got to say goodbye. And I know that feeling, too. So it's throughout.

And that's a critical point that you're making, Dr. John. It really does go back to yes, we have had historical trauma. But it's almost like upon that, I always talk about the there and then to the here and now. Just recently we've lost so many people. And so where do we start to heal?
So getting our parent educators, parent committees. And I like that comment about maybe possibly even changing the name because that Indian Parent Committee, it sounds so colonized, too. So I don't know what we could change it to but that's just another idea.

It's just a matter of really trying to get to that healing of heart. Because if your heart isn't healed, there's just no way you can learn. And so I'm just putting my own personal thoughts out there from my own experience of what I've been through with COVID and how it's impacted many of my own family and people that I know out there.

So I think that was really good dialogue right there. And I don't know if you still want to take a break. But I think that we had talked about just working through and if you needed to take a break -- I guess, you might need a break, right?

MR. GUERRERO: We don't have the luxury of time, unfortunately, Dr. Dennison. So
let's continue to move forward through the work.

CHAIR DENNISON: It was a good discussion though. But before you go on, I want to acknowledge a couple people that have joined us. And I know they're on their -- they work with us. Jenelle Leonard, who is a former -- in your position, Julian, as well as other positions she's held with the Department of Ed. She's on.

I want to acknowledge her for being on.

And then Bernard as well, Bernard Garcia is on. And so former employees of the U.S. Department of Education that have worked with us on this Council. Thank you for being here.

MR. GUERRERO: Yes. And welcome back home. I'm glad you were able to join us. So the last two items, and we are going to have to combine because we do need to conclude today's meeting at 4:00. I know you had mentioned, Dr. Dennison, ending around the same time. That will be pretty nice for my schedule as well.

But we also still need to touch base
with all the comments. We want to respect the opportunity for members of the public who weren't recognized for the beginning of this meeting but who probably are still on and patiently waiting. So I want to honor them as well.

So for these last two items on the fiscal year 2024 Department budget are the Tribal treaty rights and their provisions. I will leave -- I'm going to combine these two items together and then really solicit some input from NACIE on both, one of which for Item 3 in the departmental budget is historically, as far as I know since I've held tenure at this position, the Department has not ever solicited NACIE for budget recommendations.

And I think moving forward that will change. We want to solicit NACIE for budget recommendations. I do know in the last two iterations, NACI has recommended certain budgetary items to be brought to the table. And acknowledging what has already been presented in the annual report, what are the certain budget
priorities that the OIE should really consider moving forward, but not just the OIE but the Department at large, is my question to NACIE and to the Council. Dr. Payment?

MEMBER PAYMENT: Oh, so first of all, I'm really excited that you have committed the Department of Education to budget consultation.

So what I want to say is while this is new for NACIE and the Department of Education, it's not new across the different advisories. And so it's exciting that we're here now.

This is one of the specific things that when I got to testify during the White House council meeting with Dr. Cardona and Secretary Haaland, there was, I think, three or four of us across the country that got to present to them. And one of the specifics of my testimony was to invite Tribes to be part of the budget consultation for education.

And so NACIE is -- it's weird because NACIE is one of the oldest advisories in the country coming out of the Kennedy Report and then
the Indian Self-Determination Education Act. But this piece of it has been left out.

And then over the years the other advisories have, like STAC, I serve on the STAC, Secretary Tribal Advisory for HHS. And the new advisory that's been created for Department of Interior under Secretary Haaland is going to have a budget formulation component to it. So it's good to hear that we've arrived.

And so the way I think it's best to work is that so it just doesn't become unwieldy, you know, we're asking kind of in a piecemeal way what we need and stuff, typically the way that it's happened under the other, like Interior -- I'm also on the Tribal Interior Budget Council and then also under STAC, HHS STAC, is that the Departments do an annual budget consultation with Tribes.

And what they do is they take -- most of it is incremental budgeting. It's an increment higher than it was previously. But a good administration will listen to Indian Country
as they advocate. And the difference between what we advocate for and what we get requested in the budget is usually a pretty wide difference mainly because OMB is always tapping down and giving budget ceilings and sequestration restrictions.

And we're all discretionary unfortunately. And so the best way for this to work would be for education to identify all of the budget, Indian education or Indian-related budget items under education, and then to do a presentation back to NACIE so that we can be advisory back to the Department of Ed about consultation.

Then consultation should really happen with Indian Country, with tribes. But we can play a valuable role in helping to shape that advisory. And so I started out like getting really excited that we're here. That's as substantive of a change as you're ever going to get. And I appreciate it. So that's what I think about it at this point.
MR. GUERRERO: Thank you, Dr. Payment. Robin?

MEMBER BUTTERFIELD: Thank you for the question, Julian. And I know because you've worked at a State Department of Education, the whole bit, you're well aware that most people assume that if you're in place then all the needs of Native kids are being taken care of, you know, at the state level.

So I'm sure that the same applies with the Office of Indian Ed. You know, all the other Departments assume that, well, Native kids are being taken care of because Julian is there and his staff.

And so I think when we think about how the budget is constructed, you know, of course you've got your funding streams through, you know, Title VI. But every department is responsible for meeting the needs of Native children.

And I don't know, you know, when we use the national funds as we have over the years
to sort of specially target assessments to
determine how Native kids are doing, it seems to
me that's a Department responsibility. It's not
just a program responsibility.

And so finding a way to sort of expand the
capacity of the limited budget that we have
for Indian ed to me is a critical issue. And if
you look at all the other federal programs, they
all get per pupil monies than OIE does. And so I
think one of the -- my biggest concern is, you
know, as a federal trust responsibility, the
whole Department, you know, is supposed to be responsible and responsive to Native people
wherever they live.

It's not just the Tribes. It's the 75
percent of Native kids that are off Reservation.
You know, as Joely kind of keeps reminding us of the California situation, all our states are like
that. You know, we have one BIE school in Oregon. All of the rest of our Native kids attend public schools.

So to me the issue is how do all the
departments or the programs within the Department of Ed collaborate, coordinate and respond to the needs of Native children? Do they even collect the right kind of data so that they know who those kids are and what specific services are needed for them within their realm of responsibility?

You know, that's what I think we as NACIE try to understand. And because we've had so few meetings, we don't get the current information in terms of what the department is offering. So it's difficult for us to make recommendations if we don't know the specifics.

So that to me is a huge need in terms of determining budget priorities because we don't know who else should be paying for certain kinds of services. So the collaboration is one issue. And the responsibility of the whole department is one of the things we've tried to capture in our report every year.

And then other thing is how can we hold other systems accountable. So you've got
the Department of Ed that is supposed to influence the State Departments of Ed, you know, who are supposed to support the LEAs.

And to me one of the biggest budget items all along the way is professional development. Not the grant program for training teachers. That's a very small piece. How do we influence the regular staff of school districts in terms of their level of knowledge, the resources that they are required to teach accurate, factual history about Indian people in their communities?

You know, some of our states are way ahead of others in terms of developing curriculum. But there's not a central place to go to get that kind of information. It's such a scatter gun kind of thing across all across the country.

So all the questions you're asking, you know, how do we coordinate? How do we collaborate? How do we consolidate information so that it's easier for those of us who work with
Native children to get? So it's a lot of stuff all together.

So, you know, I'm here to help. But I just am glad that there's a responsive listening ear at the Department of Ed and hopefully some of these things can be successfully improved over time. Miigwech.

MR. GUERRERO: Thank you, Robin. And it is a journey. And I'm committed to being a part of this journey. We're all committed to being on this journey with NACIE moving this work forward. And, again, for the sake of time, we're going to touch base on the last bullet point I wanted to broach here.

This is also another very exciting movement at the Department, one of which we're working towards internally committing the Department to Tribal treaty rights and responsibilities, particularly to educational provisions within the Tribal treaties throughout the United States.

This is a very prominent issue. We're
no strangers, Native nations are no strangers to this issue. However, on implementation of such an incredible project once, many questions, many discussions of which one of those discussions leads us to the convening and consulting with this body, this Council, to discuss this item.

So with me is Dr. Amy Loyd with the Office of the Secretary, who is going to give a little bit of some context on this project as well as broaching a few questions that we want to discuss with you today. Dr. Loyd?

DR. LOYD: Thank you so much, Julian. And I just want to echo the statement that was made earlier, like knowing that Julian is in this position and leading the Office of Indian Education, like, you can have faith that there is a whole team of us here at Ed committed to leaning in and doing this hard work in partnership with you and learning from you and working with all of Indian Country on these issues related to budgeting and prioritization and ensuring that Native education is well
represented not just in Julian's office but across the entire department.

And what Julian was just mentioning, last November, many agencies signed on to a memorandum of understanding regarding interagency coordination and collaboration for the protection of Tribal treaty rights and reserved rights.

And as we all know very well, like, under the U.S. Constitution, treaties are part of the supreme law of the land, and they have the same legal force and effect as federal statutes. And we at the federal government have an obligation to honor the rights reserved for Tribes though such treaties.

And what we have started to do, and to the best of our knowledge and our team of attorneys in our Office of General Counsel, Ed has never conducted such an analysis of treaty and trust responsibilities to the degree that we have started to undertake.

So we have looked through -- OSU has put together a database of Tribal treaties. We
have looked through all of the treaties that we could find. And have found 289 education provisions in a 146 different treaties.

Examples of commitments made in these treaties include things like the provisions of teachers in schools or the maintenance of education trusts or, you know, particular allocations to Tribes to determine who their teachers should be.

So what we're doing right now is we're working to analyze these treaties to determine, like, when, have any of them been met? Like, are there outstanding treaty obligations? How do we know, you know, what is still relevant because some of them are very time bound. But, you know, how do we do that in partnership with Tribes and, of course, err on the side of deferring to Tribes in determining whether or not treaty obligations are outstanding.

Two, like, which federal agency is responsible for meeting unmet treaty obligations. And we're just looking at the education
provisions. Those of you who have read treaties, I'm assuming all of you have probably looked at a treaty, like, they encompass so many different aspects of federal engagement with Tribes.

So while we're, you know, really digging into the educational aspect, there's a lot more beyond it. And we're working with all other agencies engaged in this MOU to ensure that we're all in parallel and together thinking through our responsibilities here.

But particularly on the education piece, the Department of Education didn't exist when these treaties were written. However, we own the responsibility of education for our Native youth. So how do we ensure where BIE might be on first and where we might want to have Interior take point versus where Ed should be on first and then how do we partner with BIE to be mutually reinforcing?

And then how do we best meet these treaty obligations given like very real budgetary constraints, although that gets back to our
budgetary consultation, like, if we're going to get real about honoring treaties, we need to get real with money behind them, too. So we know this.

And we've been socializing this internally across our senior political and career staff. But this is something that we, as a whole of government, in honoring our nation to nation relationships that we hold with Tribes need to do.

And so we're thinking, like, how do we best meet those obligations, and how do we translate those into modern context since the treaty was signed?

And we're grappling with some tough questions with respect to, like, do the signatories on the treaties have since changed in terms of federally recognized tribes? So one treaty might have been signed with one Tribal group at a time that is now represented by multiple Tribal groups, most federally recognized Tribes as they are currently constituted.
Sometimes treaties have been signed by the Tribe but have since then kind of divided by federal recognition. So just the complication of signatories, but also the complication of, like, how do we ensure that we are both honoring our relationship with Tribes but also honoring our responsibility to Native students?

So recognizing that 93 percent of Native students are in traditional public schools, 75 percent are off-Reservation, like, does the treaty obligation, does it start with the Tribe or does it follow the students?

And so we are working hard. And, you know, I would love to follow-up with you with some more concrete kind of questions and details. But, like, this is something we recognize we will need to, like, will require the Tribal engagement, Tribal consultation and that will likely result in staffing, policy, programmatic and budgetary recommendations and implications. And it may also result in us at the Department engaging with state and local education agencies.
to determine our respective responsibilities for where the federal government is on first versus where state and local might need to also ensure that they are engaged since education is primarily the purview of the state.

So we just wanted to give you a preview into this so that you know that this is happening and would love just initial reactions, thoughts, recommendations on how we start to unpack this with our team of attorneys and with the other agencies.

Dr. Payment, I see your hand is up. Please jump in.

MEMBER PAYMENT: Yes. So I'm really, really excited about this topic. And I hope -- I'm only going to talk a couple of minutes. But I hope I will get it all out.

DR. LOYD: Maybe that's your original hand?

MEMBER PAYMENT: No, it's me. Can you hear me? Can you hear me now?

DR. LOYD: Oh, yes, now I can.
MEMBER PAYMENT: Okay. So I'm excited about this. And my very first recommendation is for us, with us.

DR. LOYD: Yes.

MEMBER PAYMENT: As you have this conversation, Tribal leaders need to be engaged, our advisory here, obviously. And if you look through our report, our report did a really good job this last year of outlining this.

But we get very nervous, Indian Country gets very nervous when we're talking about interpretation of treaties. But you said all the magic words because the canons of construction, interpreting them as Indian Tribes would have interpreted, is the standard that the Marshall trilogy established.

And I would say, you know, just broadly the tag line that NCAI, NIEA uses, is, you know, our treaty rights for education are embedded in treaties. They're legislative precedents and also administrative determinations and commitments, Executive Orders, Presidential
Memorandum.

But, you know, the one thing I want to be real careful about is the treaty are buried in the level of detail and in the specifics and in the broader sort of notion of the obligation to provide for Tribes.

And the principle of it is the exchange of something for something. And the something the federal government got was 500 acres of land, and what Tribes were promised were health education and social welfare. If we look at the Treaty of Fort Laramie for as long as the grass grows, the winds blow and the rivers flow.

And I'm thinking, man, I would really like those negotiators on my team because our elders knew what they were doing because the envisioned how to provide for well into the future. Even with the language barriers, they had a clear sense of what they were doing and obligating the federal government to.

So one thing also I want to be careful about on behalf of Alaska because the treaty era
ended abruptly through fights between Congress and the President in 1887, and the end of the treaty era happened. But Alaska obviously didn't become a state in the union until almost 100 years later. And so they don't technically have a treaty right, but they have a treaty and trust obligation.

Just because the treaty era ended or this also covers the variances in the treaties, we believe in Indian Country that the obligation exists equally to all Tribes across the country. But we also know, if you look at the Meriam Report, the Indian Education Report, and go forward to the Kennedy Report and then you go forward to the recommendations in the Indian Self-Determination and Education Act, you have some people that are on our committee that were intimately involved in writing those reports and pushing that enactment of that legislation, you can see that the federal government has failed miserably in fulfilling the treaty and trust obligation for education.
The fact that we don't have a real good statistic about how we're doing, a graduation rate, that needs to be examined. It means that we haven't taken it serious.

But I do think the first step in getting a real clear eyed understanding that will transcend whoever is President is to be able to pin this down.

One last thing I want to say -- two last things, quick, is that our right is not race based. That it's based on a political status. And Morton v. Mancari is the case that we look to for that.

We fought -- I serve on the staff for HHS, and we fought the civil rights division of HHS, who was trying to argue against certain provisions in the Affordable Care Act for Tribes. They made it up. In the absence of any case law, they just completely made it up.

So what we are doing, the work we are doing, will be valuable because it will transcend the political ups and downs and policy
persuasions of whoever is in charge.

But the final thing I wanted to say is in 1934, so there's an author that I used in my doctorate, John Rury, his last name R-U-R-Y, did a really good treatment of all of the history of Indian education and real solid on Indian Education.

And so where things fundamentally changed was about 1934 when the federal government started recognizing the responsibility to educate Americans and then at the time three states negotiated to accept the responsibility, Michigan, Minnesota and Colorado. And they pledged to provide for college tuition.

Now some will argue that didn't really say that. But the education at that time was vocational so it really does obligate them.

And so Senator Ben Nighthorse Campbell has draft legislation that he's been pushing, but it hasn't gotten enacted yet. And it's for the federal government to follow through on that commitment for the state accepted the land of
former boarding schools in exchange for a pledge to provide public education, K through 12 and higher ed for all American Indians in those respective states.

That's how the Colorado provision came to be in Minnesota. They're fully funding their Native students. Michigan is not quite there, but we're working on it. But I appreciate the work that you guys are doing because it's the first time somebody is actually pinning it down.

DR. LOYD: You know, I have to say, like, all of us have gotten half teary eyed and goose bumpy while reading through the treaties and thinking through the implications of this work because it really is historic and incredibly foundational and important to our tribes and our people.

And, so, like, yes, some of the questions that you were just addressing, like, we've been zooming in on the treaties because they are technical, legal contracts.

We recognize beyond the treaties, the
federal government has a broad trust responsibility to all federally recognized tribes, which includes that special responsibility for education. And so, you know, that's another issue.

I know it's in your report multiple times and that, you know, I have often referenced treaty and trust responsibilities. We need to get clear on what we mean by trust responsibilities so that's another aspect that we're working on this work.

And in many treaties, there were signs before systems of higher education were in place. So to your last point about Minnesota, Michigan and Colorado, like thinking about the treat context interpretation for today. Like, how do we ensure that we equally implicating our higher education system so that not just pre-K-12, or K-12, but also post-secondary credentials are part of what we consider to be the public good and the responsibility for education.

So we're leaning into this. We
welcome follow-up. We look forward to bringing to you some, you know, concrete questions and next steps and where we go with this. But it will have, you know, implications that we think about, both the recommendations that you've been making to us and our budgetary consultations that we will be doing with you down the road.

So thank you in advance for your guidance. Go ahead.

MEMBER PAYMENT: Julian, you got somebody else lined up? I hope I didn't burn up all of our time.

MR. GUERRERO: I think we have time for one other one.

CHAIR DENNISON: Who has their hand up? Anyone? I don't see any hands up, Julian, but I could be wrong. But I just want to say that this is very, very good work that you are all doing and, you know, I'm glad that you are bringing it to us.

It's just wonderful that we are going that far back and looking at the treaty rights
and the educational provisions because so many have just forgotten, honestly, especially in the public school system so thank you for that.

And thank you for a reminder that, you know, they do exist and the rights that maybe haven't forgotten us and part of our whole dilemma on the journey towards seeing healthier school systems for our Native indigenous children across the country. So thank you for that.

I don't see anyone else's hand up though. So I think I'm...

MR. GUERRERO: Why don't we go ahead and move to public comment, if you're okay with that Chairperson Dennison?

CHAIR DENNISON: Yes. I do know that. I was looking through my email. I didn't find any public comments that were sent to me. I understand there were three that were sent. And I don't know who they are from. But if you sent in a public comment and you're here, we'd like to hear from you first before opening it up to others.
MS. SABIS-BURNS: Actually, Dr. Dennison, this is Donna. We did reach out to those who sent in public comments. And we will be sharing them with you and have told them that they need to be studied.

And I, as DFO, and, of course, in consultation with you, the chair, will take a look at all the comments and then we can address them at a later date just so there's time to study them.

Because there were some that were quite lengthy and one just came in right before the meeting.

CHAIR DENNISON: Thank you for that, Donna.

MS. SABIS-BURNS: Sure.

MR. GUERRERO: So we'll go ahead and open it up to the public if you have any comments you would like to make about the discussion today or yesterday and you'd like to add something to the dialogue that we already had, you're open to -- you will be given three minutes.
And since we don't have that many, we might even give you more minutes. So let's see the hands of people that would like to make public comment.

MS. SABIS-BURNS: And, Dr. Dennison, our contractor will also help identify those who have their hands raised just to give you some support.

DR. DENNISON: Thank you. There's a Terri Beale-Saucedo, who I know very well from the Arizona Department of Education, is one hand I see. so

ZOOM HOST: Terri, your line is muted.

MS. BEALER-SAUCEDO: Okay. Thank you. I really appreciate the opportunity to participate in this forum. And it just -- we were doing some of the similar things. And I read the comment that was made about it's not just a program area responsibility. It's departments, you know. And we're doing that within the Arizona Department of Education. And I'm the Tribal Grant Specialist with the Office
of Indian Education at the state.

And so it's real exciting to see that pushback. That it's not just a program responsibility. But just as we're doing within AVE, we're working with our program counterparts and coordinating. And I love the comment about the data collection because you're absolutely right with the budget you can't make those types of decisions until you know what is already out there. And we're trying to work with ours to clean it up.

So I think again working at a collaborative coordinated collection area is key.

And one of the things that we've started here in Arizona through the National Johnson-O'Malley Association is an Arizona-wide Johnson-O'Malley forum to be able to collectively come together with all of -- we just seem to work in pockets. And everybody struggles with the same questions, the same challenges.

So instead we're now pulling it together at a state level to try to address all
of those and then working collaboratively with the BIE and, again, that's Johnson-O'Malley. So I just want to say thank you. This is excellent. And I look forward to being involved in future discussions.

CHAIR DENNISON: Thank you, Terri. I don't see any other hands. Oh, Sahmie, also from the Arizona Department of Education who works with us a lot in our school system, you're next.

MS. WYTEWA: Excuse me. Good afternoon, everybody. I want to thank U.S. Ed, BIE and NACIE for this space. It's been, I think, very empowering over the last couple of days to hear the reflections and just the advocacy at this level. So thank you so much for that.

The first part that I wanted to touch on was identity. I think that if we can build out resources for strengthening cultural identity, it helps us as individuals to navigate the spaces between K-12, higher ed to career knowing that our greatest asset is who we are,
what we represent in culture and spirituality in order to give back to our community in any way whether we choose to be educated or in other fashions.

The second part would be related to guidance from U.S. Ed, OIE and NACIE's advocacy around policy and the strong -- I guess a stronger phrasing of the responsibilities by state.

One of the things that has been a barrier or a challenge is receiving funding, whether that's determined by the legislature or the state education agency. And if it's reinforced at the highest level that this is a responsibility of every state, that does have power of how we respond to that guidance and directive.

So instead of making this an issue between party lines, we should demonstrate full support for full funding of the Office of Indian Education at the state level and trickle down into our school districts and communities.
Thank you so much.


MR. MONCHAMP. Hi. Can you hear me?

CHAIR DENNISON: Yes.

MR. MONCHAMP: Okay. Good. I had some trouble with my audio in the room. Building a JOM Program coordinates, the Minnesota Chippewa Tribe asked me to listen in here. She's on travel.

And we have some -- I'm trying to find a euphemism here for our funding mechanism that has come to light here from BIE, Spike Bighorn. I don't know if you all know him. They said they're revisiting a funding mechanism for JOM programs here, and they're not allowing certain systems that have been in place for 80 some years here.

They're not allowing feasts, doing achievement awards, certificates, pendants, pow wows, meals for the parents, just a whole array of unallowable costs.
I mean there is -- it's between what Spike said and what Carmen Vander-something, I can't find her email here but nevertheless I researched this, what he called them. I got the email from Spike about now allowing costs.

He said there was a Tribal consultation, but we have yet to get any information as to what tribes are involved in this alleged Tribal consultation because we can't find anyone anywhere that has been a part of this.

And so we're asking you guys, you know, as a national organization here for a system that should be in place that will adjust this. I know you guys said you were going to NIA or NACIE or what have you because this needs to be addressed right away because it's just unbelievable.

And I don't know who you said -- what's her name that said that, has the public comments. But she should have this letter that Billy sent. And so what we're looking for is
guidance here and somebody to get involved with JOM here to start adjusting these needs because we haven't heard from any other programs.

So if the country, in fact the last report that you guys put on meSpeak, I referenced that. I sent a copy to Billy who in turn sent it to -- what's the name, Bighorn here. And he said that was outdated because we use that as an example of all of the costs.

So you guys might want to visit I believe Arizona. She just spoke here just a little while ago that sent all of those allowable costs in that paper, you know. And allowable, so I mean, it's just -- I don't know if this is a system that's going to be in place or how they're going to direct us because we haven't been getting any answers.

So, I guess, what I'm trying to do is trying to find to get answers as to where were these Tribal consultations? Why are all of a sudden that you're submitting unallowable costs for us and how widespread this is going to be
within JOM program for the country.

And lastly for the countdown, it was suggested they are going to be starting looking at blood quantum in that because those of you in the JOM program, we have to have, you know, a quarter of blood in a lot of our Tribes where some Tribes go on lineage. So they use that as a means to get their funding for the JOM, the funding mechanism there.

But we have to start looking at, you know, my Tribe here, Leech Lake, one of the six tribes in the Minnesota Chippewa Tribe, that's what we use, a quarter of blood here.

And so we have to start addressing that as well. And I think you guys should start putting that on your agenda here and how we can address that at the national level. Questions, comments? That's it.

CHAIR DENNISON: Thank you. I lost my connection for a while there. Thank you for that. Any other comments or questions, public comments out there to be made? If not, that will
complete our public comment section.

ZOOM HOST: There is one more.

CHAIR DENNISON: Yes, Sydna Yellowfish. Okay.

MS. YELLOWFISH: Hello. Sydna Yellowfish, Edmond, Oklahoma. I appreciate being able to listen in on this. I was only able to listen in today. But a wealth of information and discussion that is very helpful for those of us that are on the ground here with Title VI and Johnson-O'Malley programs and with our 1,500 plus students in Edmond public schools.

A couple of things I would like to mention. I appreciate Robin's comment on collaborating with the Department. I believe that is very important because we have to collaborate here on the local level with our federal programs, other federal programs, as a part of our Tribal consultation that we do.

It's not just Title VI Indian education, it's all other title programs within our school district. So that would be really
good if OIE, Department of Education, does collaborate with the other departments of whomever has a part of educating all students, especially our Native students.

I also wanted to comment on the funding. I think in my -- I think I submitted a written comment. And if I'm not mistaken -- I'm trying to pull that up. But, I mean, we are having to deal with pre and post-pandemic issues now with our Native students and our Indian children.

And, you know, if we are to address the social, emotional well-being of our Indian children, then we need to get the additional funds to help us get field staff, field workers to help address those needs because with doing everyday needs of, I don't know, behavior checks, attendance checks, weekly grade checks, going out to the schools.

And if you have a school district like ours, we have 28 schools that we work with and right now we're at three staff. So we're looking
at 500 kids per one staff if you divide it up like that that our one staff person is responsible for.

So, again, it seems like we might be having, I guess you could say, maybe unfunded mandates that might be requested of us as far as Indian education. So if we can get some of those additional -- from what I'm hearing, social, emotional well-being, which I definitely know is a need, then also help us to get our increased funding to get a staff skilled person that can help us address those needs.

I just kind of wanted to comment on that, and I appreciate the comments on parent committee meetings, child identity, all of that is very much -- it should be on every Indian education program's information. Thank you.

CHAIR DENNISON: Thank you, too. I have another hand up, Sonja Killips.

MS. KILLIPS: Can you hear me?

(Simultaneous speaking.)

MR. GUERRERO: Yes, we can hear you.
MS. KILLIPS: (Native language spoken.) Hello. My name is Sonja Killips. I am an introduction Anishinaabe language teacher at Brimley Area School. It is a public school.

And I would like to acknowledge Sydna Yellowfish for the social and emotional aspects that were brought up just now under COVID. Those needs are really important. And I think we really need to put a huge amount of effort because if we fall behind -- if we notice that we fall behind all the things we don't know is times four. And then we're playing catch-up.

And so we're already playing catch-up. Let don't play catch-up with our children's emotion and the social needs that they have really been thrown through the ringer.

As for the conversation right before that regarding blood quantum, I know the feds are going to go through and say, well, that's -- we made that on purpose and, you know, we can't change that.

It is a Tribal problem that has
actually an easy fix. And I did not know it could be an easy fix so we have to educate our youth because it will impact our youth. I've done that multiple, multiple years over the 10 years at Brimley School.

And the last conference I had, a workshop on tuition waiver and Tribal incentives for my students, my students are a majority of two different Tribes.

Out of the 15 students there, less than half are even eligible for tuition waiver. And here I am getting paid to give this conversation to you and to them, and I also am not eligible for tuition waiver. But I told them in order for your guys to change it, it has to be up to you.

Because we had high schoolers graduating and then realizing they were not a quarter with their Tribe. But if we went down the road and that sister Tribe, that brother/sister Tribe took in a different band, they actually met the quantum to be a quarter. I
was one of those.

Other families were going to lose children, brilliant, brilliant people by having the blood quantum down the road and then being able to afford college. And it would change the makeup of our Tribe forever.

And those students did that last summer. Students go that done and that is the quickest way to get changes done because it affects them. That's what I'd like to say on that. Thank you very much. Miigwech.

CHAIR DENNISON: Thank you so much. I think we will end there. So I don't see any more hands up. I'd like to go ahead and end there because that gives us enough time for closing comments, closing remarks from the NACIE counsel. Are there any closing remarks that you would like to make before I make the final closing remarks? I'll call on you.

MEMBER PAYMENT: Can you hear me?

CHAIR DENNISON: Now we can, Aaron.

MEMBER PAYMENT: All right. So I was
having a snack real quick so I had to quickly swallow it.

So I'm excited that Sonja was on because Sonja's grandmother was one of my mentors who brought back our education in my community and also our culture and our traditions, our pow wows. She was our Title Indian education worker when I was a high delinquent. You can read into that whatever you want to.

But I'm just really excited about our session today and yesterday and about the administration hearing some key elements of what we've been pushing in our annual report with respect to the treaties, the trust obligation budget formulation and the data aspects of what we need to do in evaluating whether or not the federal government is fulfilling its treaty and trust obligation.

But I was very encouraged today to hear the commitment to do a deeper dive on the treaties. And so I'm just so happy to be part of a group that is the best qualified, the highest
educated, the most experienced Indian educators in the country. And I'm happy to be part of your group. Miigwech.

CHAIR DENNISON: Thank you, Dr. Payment. We're proud to have you as part of the group. Anybody else? Okay. Robin and then Virginia.

MEMBER BUTTERFIELD: Thank you. I think Virginia had her hand up first. But just quickly, thank you so much for kind of the inspiring leadership in the Department, being willing to meet with us. I think that's a real plus going forward.

I'm really excited about the fact that they are taking a serious look at treaties and obligations as a result of that.

And I also want to thank you, Julian, for asking us so many thought provoking questions, you know, not just giving us a dry report but, you know, inviting us to help problem solve with you. That's what I think we're here for is, you know, to provide some insights from
various different vantage points, and I appreciate that very much.

So miigwech and pinagigi. And I don't know when our next meeting is other than to validate the report. That's only probably going to be an hour. So the sooner we could get that on the books the better. Thank you.

CHAIR DENNISON: Okay. And then Virginia?

MEMBER THOMAS: Can you hear me?

CHAIR DENNISON: Yes.

MEMBER THOMAS: Good. Thank you. I just wanted to say a thank you to all of the people behind the scene. I don't know about you, but I don't know if I could have gotten on these calls the last couple of days if it wasn't for the work of the people behind the scenes who go unsung, but we couldn't have done this without you.

And I just wanted, just to be on the books, be acknowledged for the staff there, through the Department, that you do all the leg
work getting this ready and prompted us, getting the information out to the Board. I really appreciate it.

I made somebody staff of the day yesterday. And she still is today because we couldn't have done this without you. And I just want to say a big thank you to all of you that work behind the scenes with this.

CHAIR DENNISON: Thank you, Virginia. Joely?

MEMBER PROUDFIT: Yes. I echo the thank you's and the gratuity to the wonderful people and the wonderful colleagues and the OIE staff and our amazing NACIE committee who, I'm just in such awe of all the work that you all do to support Indian Education. I know how challenging it is.

I just wanted to close with some comments because there have been some recent actions here in California. And I've been consoling students, believe it or not, over what normally appears to be really good news.
And hearing the discussion about treaties, it's really weighing heavy on my heart. It was announced on Friday, the UC regents, you know the UC, UCLA, Berkeley, those schools had announced free tuition for residents of California who are members of federally-recognized Tribes.

And while that's a wonderful piece of information, we have so many California Indian students that are non-members for a variety of reasons, the least of which have to do with blood quantum. So let me first put that out there. And they don't qualify for that benefit to go to school that are literally on their own homelands.

And that has to be addressed because not only they qualify for this benefit, they don't qualify for a whole host of resources and benefits intended to support students and to honor the trust relationship.

And these students are documented students who can show their ancestry to federally-recognized Tribes through the
California judgment rolls, through certificate degrees of Indian blood. And so I want us to be mindful about making sure that we don't leave any of our students behind.

And California is a very interested place in that our treaties were never ratified. They were hid in a vault under the act of secrecy for 53 years. And because of that, California Indians were able to sue and received a mere 47 cents an acre for that dust of our land. And so while we're not considered treaty Tribes per se and have Executive Orders, we continue to be underserved.

And as I console my students who are born and raised on their Reservation but for various reasons are no enrolled in their Tribes and are considered Tribal descendants, they cannot qualify for many of the financial opportunities that exist.

So I want us to be very thoughtful in making sure not only that we count accurate data but that we find ways in which to include those
very students who are speaking their language and practicing their traditions and living literally on their Tribal homeland.

But when we make these very interesting determinations based on very colonial structures, we exclude the very people we're trying to serve. And so I want us to recognize that because I've been addressing this in the last few days with several of my students who are outside of my door right now about, you know, answering the question when they say, well, what about me?

And so I just wanted to -- you know, I told them I would bring this to this committee that we think about those students. So thank you for the time to let me share that.

CHAIR DENNISON: Thank you, Joely. Patricia?

MEMBER WHITEFOOT: Yes. I just wanted to remind us again that the work that we do in Indian Education is really about building Indian Nations. And I echo everything that my
colleagues have shared in addition to what Joely has said, you know, the students that I was teaching at a middle school, I have many children who are descendants and not enrolled either in the Tribes.

And so just, you know, helping students to be able to identify what their ethnicity, their background, their heritage. So I think -- I agree, we need to be very mindful of all of our students and just remember that, you know, as I participated or as I had a role in our Tribal council, our governing committee for our Tribe, I had the opportunity to see, you know, all of the applicants that were coming through to be enrolled in our Tribe.

And when you look at your individual's backgrounds, we are a very diverse people with diverse backgrounds. And so we have to recognize that as well. And this has been a big discussion as well in our community. As a matter of fact, it has been going on on the Facebook here in the Northwest.
And I know through the Northwest Tribal representation and resolution that was submitted maybe about two years, three years ago to the National Congress of American Indians just on this issue. And so that's one of the reasons that I advocate also for our Tribal leaders to be engaged with this conversation because it's our Tribal leaders who are going to make those decisions about, you know, service to our children.

And similarly like Indian Health Service, we really have to take a look at all of these service providers that exist within our Tribal communities and urban communities, wherever our Tribal people are, we just need to take a hard look at, you know, all these federal agencies and the interrelationships that we have with them.

And, of course, you've heard me over and over say let's build on head start. Let's take that comprehensive education, you know, up into K-12. There's nothing that says that we
can't do that.

And I just urge us not to stay in those silos of Title I, Title VI, Title IX, whatever you have, because as Tribes, we've been able to demonstrate taking those apart and pulling back together our own programs, particularly with Health and Human Services.

So I look forward to our ongoing dialogue that we'll be having and also rolling up our sleeves to begin working on our next report for next year for Congress. Thank you.

CHAIR DENNISON: Thank you, Patricia.

And I know we're getting close to the 4 o'clock hour in Washington. I just want to say thank you to all of you. I'm very touched, as others have stated, I'm very touched in my heart, about the discussion that we had not just yesterday but also today about the things that are happening.

I think we've really done the reset completely, and I'm appreciative of all those that took part in putting this together from Amy Loyd to the staff there, Donna to Julian to Dr.
Mackey also who has come on board recently, and all of you that have really understood, I guess, the pride that I felt about NACIE and about the work that we do and I really want it to be meaningful.

And I've shared this through email with my colleagues on NACIE that, you know, there comes a time, and I've reached that time in my life where you start to really assess and evaluate after you have something tragic happen to you or to your family.

And so that was where it came from from my heart that I felt like, man, we really need to make our work -- we need to show the evidence of our work that we've been doing. And I feel really good about it now. So I thank you all from the bottom of my heart for that, for making it happen and getting the Secretary here.

And I would like to ask, I guess, it would be Dr. Mackey if she would be okay with going back to the Executive Order and talking about the labor -- the Secretary of Labor and the
Secretary of the Interior. It really would be good again as we're talking about connecting that we at least have one of the Secretaries on at each of the meetings because that way it will be more comprehensive in the work that we do. And we will be able to touch all the lives that we're trying to make a difference in in education from the pre-kindergarten, maybe even head start all the way to whatever Ph.D. programs, EDD programs, whatever programs that are out there that our children and our young adults want to attend, or are attending right now.

So I just wanted to say that because it is a time to reset. And I feel like this could really accomplish that. And I want to thank you all for bearing with me, bearing with NACI as we move forward and continue the work that we do, and it's so important.

And I know that you set the date for your subcommittee meetings. If we can send that out through an email that would be really good. Then be thinking about a date for our face-to-
face meeting that's not too far out. But we don't want to make it too far out and just be mindful of the fact that the office staff at OIE and other departments that we want to be on the agenda, they would have to be paid overtime if we did it on the weekend or if we also had to go into different hours where they're not working.

So if it's face-to-face, we also have to consider the time difference so that we don't get into the -- we don't now the budget for next year. So I'm just saying let's kind of hold tight on the next meeting face-to-face. I really do want to do that, but I think we've got to also wait for the next budget cycle to know what's being appropriated. Unless you already know it, I don't think so.

So, you know, it's just one of those things that we've got to wait for too as well as far as the budget moving forward. But it's really been a great, great dialogue, all of us together, and even the public input that we had from the public. Thank you all for those of you
that participated.

Now I want to call on Virginia to do the closing prayer. We've never done a closing prayer. But I feel like we need to close with a prayer as we go on and journey forward from here.

Thank you.

MEMBER ANDERSON: Can you hear me?

CHAIR DENNISON: Thank you.

(Simultaneous speaking.)

MEMBER ANDERSON: Was someone speaking?

MR. LESSARD: That was me. I'm sorry.

MEMBER ANDERSON: Go ahead.

MR. LESSARD: No, no. I'm waiting for you. I'm sorry.

MEMBER ANDERSON: Oh, okay. Well, thank you. I thank you, Dr. Dennison, for this honor. I opened this up, and I appreciate the opportunity to close our meeting.

I, like all of you, have missed you all. It was so good to hear your voice and to know that you're all well and safe. So let's go
to the morning prayer.

Lord Jesus, I thank you for this time that we've had together. I thank you for all the people involved that put this together. Let our ears be open. Let our hearts be warm. Let us know that we can accomplish what was given to us as a task.

Lord, I ask that you bless the people that are on the council. Bless those who are in attendance today and hear these words. I thank you for Dr. Dennison, for her time to give to us, to her ability to lead us and to make sure that she is safe and well, and that we can depend upon her as our chairperson.

I ask that you put your hands upon the Department staff that they will be blessed for all of the work that they do for our people. And they understand the importance by listening to our concerns. Lord, I thank you for this.

I thank that you for giving everybody traveling mercies. I ask you that you provide them a safe place and for them to be well and
healthy. I ask this all in your precious name. Amen.

MEMBER PAYMENT: You're on mute, Dr. D.

ZOOM HOST: Deborah, you are muted.

CHAIR DENNISON: Oh, I said, thank you, Virginia. That ends our day two so we'll need a motion to adjourn.

MR. LESSARD: Thanks, Dr. Dennison. This is Ron. Be safe.

CHAIR DENNISON: Sure. Thank you, Ron.

MR. LESSARD: Thank you.

MEMBER BUTTERFIELD: I move to adjourn.

CHAIR DENNISON: We have a motion to adjourn. Is there a second?

MEMBER JOHN: Second.

CHAIR DENNISON: Everyone in favor?

(Chorus of ayes.)

CHAIR DENNISON: Counsel is adjourned.

Thank you.

(Whereupon, the above-entitled matter went off the record at 4:03 p.m.)