

## UNITED STATES OF AMERICA

+ + + + +

## DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION

+ + + + +

## NATIONAL ADVISORY COUNCIL ON INDIAN EDUCATION

+ + + + +

MONDAY  
DECEMBER 13, 2021

+ + + + +

The Advisory Council met via Video Teleconference, at 1:00 p.m. ESTABLISHED, Deborah Jackson-Dennison, Chairperson, presiding.

PRESENT

DEBORAH JACKSON-DENNISON, Chairperson  
CHIEF PHYLISS ANDERSON, Member  
THERESA AREVGAQ JOHN, Member  
DOREEN BROWN, Member  
ROBIN BUTTERFIELD, Member  
AARON PAYMENT, Member  
JOELY PROUDFIT, Member  
MANDY SMOKER-BROADDUS, Member  
PATRICIA WHITEFOOT, Member

ALSO PRESENT

JULIAN GUERRERO, U.S. Department of Education  
RON LESSARD, U.S. Department of Education  
DONNA SABIS-BURNS, U.S. Department of Education  
ANGELA HERNANDEZ, Designated Federal Officer (DFO), U.S.  
Department of Education  
LISA SADEGHI, U.S. Department of Education  
MAHOGANY HOPKINS, LPE Associates (LPE)  
SHIRLEY ENG, Manhattan Strategy Group

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

1 P-R-O-C-E-E-D-I-N-G-S

2 1:29 p.m.

3 DR. JACKSON-DENNISON: Good afternoon or good  
4 morning, wherever you are. Hello, NACIE members. I'd  
5 like to go ahead and call this meeting to order. It is  
6 about 11:29 a.m. I'd also first like to start with the  
7 roll call so can we have a roll call for the minutes?  
8 Can you take roll, Angela?

9 MS. HERNANDEZ: Yes, Dr. Dennison. I'm going to  
10 go ahead and start with you. Dr. Deborah Dennison?

11 DR. JACKSON-DENNISON: I'm here.

12 MS. HERNANDEZ: Dr. Aaron Payment?

13 DR. PAYMENT: Here.

14 MS. HERNANDEZ: Robin Butterfield?

15 MS. BUTTERFIELD: Here.

16 MS. HERNANDEZ: Mandy Smoker-Broaddus?

17 MS. SMOKER-BROADDUS: Here.

18 MS. HERNANDEZ: Dr. Theresa John?

19 DR. JOHN: Here.

20 MS. HERNANDEZ: Patricia Whitefoot? Patricia, I  
21 see that you're here. Is it possible for you to click  
22 your unmute? I think it's in the lower left corner.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

1 MS. WHITEFOOT: I did -- there she is.

2 MS. HERNANDEZ: There you go. Thank you. Dr.  
3 Joely Proudfit?

4 DR. PROUDFIT: Here.

5 MS. HERNANDEZ: Doreen Brown?

6 MS. BROWN: Here.

7 MS. HERNANDEZ: Thank you, Doreen. Virginia  
8 Thomas? Virginia Thomas is not here for the record. And  
9 Phyliss Anderson. Phyliss Anderson is also not here for  
10 the record. Okay, Dr. Dennison, I'll turn it back to  
11 you.

12 DR. JACKSON-DENNISON: All right. Thank you,  
13 Angela. I'd like to ask -- I'm going to ask Aaron because  
14 I know we're very thankful to him, but I'm going to ask  
15 you, Dr. Payment, if you can just open up with a prayer  
16 for us?

17 DR. PAYMENT: Oh, yes.

18 (Native language spoken.)

19 DR. PAYMENT: So I just said a traditional prayer,  
20 and I said it like an Ontario Ojibwe which is really  
21 fast. I'll translate it later so we don't run out of  
22 time.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

1 (Native language spoken.)

2 DR. JACKSON-DENNISON: Okay, thank you, Dr.  
3 Payment. I know we have a little time before we might  
4 lose our quorum so I just want to entertain a motion from  
5 anyone. Also, before we entertain the motion I want to  
6 give my thanks out to those of you that really helped  
7 with the annual report. This is the main meaning of  
8 today's -- purpose of today's meeting is to approve the  
9 annual report with the idea that we will go back and  
10 tweak it some still. I know there's still some things  
11 that need to be tweaked so I'd like to entertain a motion  
12 for that.

13 DR. PAYMENT: Madam Chair, I'll make a motion to  
14 approve the annual report as substantively submitted with  
15 any additions, deletions, or corrections to come  
16 thereafter by a vote without objection.

17 MS. BROWN: I'll second.

18 DR. JACKSON-DENNISON: Okay. Who beat who to the  
19 second? Doreen?

20 MS. BROWN: Doreen.

21 DR. JACKSON-DENNISON: Okay. We'll go with  
22 Doreen. All in favor say aye.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

1 (Chorus of ayes)

2 DR. JACKSON-DENNISON: Are there any comments or  
3 questions? Okay. Any opposition?

4 (No response)

5 DR. JACKSON-DENNISON: Anybody went to -- I know  
6 I kind of went ahead of it, but any comments before we  
7 do that?

8 (No response)

9 DR. JACKSON-DENNISON: Okay. I think the motion  
10 passed 8-0. Now, I want to turn it over to our chair of  
11 -- which is Robin of the subcommittee and have her.

12 MS. BUTTERFIELD: Okay, well let's just put the  
13 document up on the screen.

14 MS. ENG: Can you see it? I put it up.

15 MS. BUTTERFIELD: Yes. So we did change the cover  
16 and really looked for some good pictures. And I think  
17 we've got a really beautiful cover. I personally like  
18 it a lot. So we'll just move on.

19 Do we want any comments to go in the chat, Angela?  
20 Would that help?

21 MS. HERNANDEZ: Yes.

22 MS. BUTTERFIELD: Okay.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

1 MS. HERNANDEZ: People can do it verbally or  
2 written if they choose. But yes, if there's anything  
3 that they'd like to state explicitly as an edit that  
4 would be good. Or they can send it to us after as well.

5 MS. BUTTERFIELD: Okay. And then the way we've  
6 been doing this at our meetings is whoever was kind of  
7 assigned that section sort of led the discussion, and  
8 then we moved to the next section and whoever was in  
9 charge.

10 So all we need at this point for those who haven't  
11 been privy to all those conversations is if we could have  
12 the author of that section just hit the high points.  
13 What were the sort of key changes. We're not going to  
14 get into wordsmithing because after this process we will  
15 have another edit by both the Department of Ed[ucation]  
16 staff as well as the editor. So it will be fine-tuned  
17 if there are some things. So those kind of edits we will  
18 just bypass for today.

19 So I believe Aaron, your name is on the --

20 DR. PAYMENT: No. Dr. D. But all I did, Dr. D,  
21 is I didn't change any of the substance. Well, I guess  
22 in the last paragraph you can see I -- but I just

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

1 reformatted it so it would all fit on two pages and be  
2 aesthetically pleasing.

3 And you can see where on that last paragraph I  
4 just corrected a little bit, like Secretary Cardona, in  
5 parentheses Education Secretary Haaland, in parentheses  
6 Interior, Secretary Walsh (Labor). So that's not  
7 substantive, it's technical I think.

8 Also, I added -- this is something we can change  
9 if we need to, but I added the congressman from Hawaii.  
10 The Congressional Record recognizes him as a Native  
11 American. He's Native Hawaiian, but he caucuses with  
12 the Native American caucus. And in the Congressional  
13 Record he is listed as an indigenous person.

14 MR. LESSARD: Aaron, could I ask a question? This  
15 is Ron. I'm not sure if it was in the past, but I believe  
16 it could also go -- I thought about this -- to the  
17 Education Oversight Committee, the chairpersons and  
18 ranking members, both the Congress side and the Senate  
19 side.

20 I think that has happened in the past and I just  
21 wanted to comment on that while we're on this section  
22 right now.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

1 DR. PAYMENT: I'm wondering if we can circulate  
2 it to them without having to put them in here. What this  
3 principally is, up top you can see the leadership in the  
4 House and Senate, both the majority and the minority.  
5 And then the only other ones we listed to get it was the  
6 Congressional Native Caucus. The indigenous people that  
7 are on the Congressional Native Caucus.

8 MR. LESSARD: Okay.

9 DR. PAYMENT: Plus right now it sits on two pages.

10 MR. LESSARD: Would they get -- the Education  
11 Oversight Committee would receive copies as it's sent?  
12 Is that right?

13 DR. PAYMENT: Yes, I think we can -- that's just  
14 in the delivery of it.

15 MS. BUTTERFIELD: Yes, I think right now we're  
16 just following protocol in terms of sending it to the  
17 chairs of both houses. They should pass it on to their  
18 subcommittees.

19 MR. LESSARD: Thank you.

20 MS. BUTTERFIELD: Okay. So then we've got the  
21 table of contents. And we are going to be linking the  
22 executive summary sections. So somebody could click on,

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

1 say, 1.3 and it would take them directly to that section.  
2 Isn't that's correct?

3 MS. ENG: Yes.

4 MS. BUTTERFIELD: Okay. So all of that -- and  
5 all of those substantive recommendations have been  
6 reworked and they align with the recommendations within  
7 the report.

8 Okay, so now we are moving on to the context  
9 section which is -- if you notice has been greatly  
10 improved. And we've got subheaders in the different  
11 sections. I'm getting a little dizzy. Oh here we go.  
12 All right. So this whole section is trying to make sure  
13 that those who are new and don't know much about Indian  
14 education get some good historical background as well as  
15 current legislation. Let's just kind of move through  
16 it.

17 DR. PAYMENT: Robin? The interagency MOU on the  
18 treaty rights was perfect. And I highlighted it up front  
19 because it mirrors what we were saying. But it's now  
20 the President issuing that order, reinforcing the treaty  
21 and trust responsibilities. So it fits perfectly at the  
22 top.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

1 MS. BUTTERFIELD: Awesome. Well, Aaron, this is  
2 your section. Why don't you walk us through this piece.

3 DR. PAYMENT: Okay. So it's extremely well  
4 documented. It would pass dissertation Q&A. So, we just  
5 strengthened it from last year to now. Wherever we  
6 didn't have a citation throughout the whole document we  
7 paid a lot of attention to getting those citations so it  
8 can stand up.

9 Just one technical thing. Later if we can work  
10 out the spacing in the footnotes because I think it's  
11 got different formatting that has been copied. So we'll  
12 just get that cleaned up. But we'll work on that just  
13 as a technical thing. All right, you want to go to the  
14 next page?

15 We're not going to labor through everything.  
16 Everybody can read it. We pulled things from the past  
17 report. We strengthened it by giving citations, a little  
18 more clear on the history. This is a really good  
19 standalone history. For somebody who doesn't know it  
20 before they'll know it after reading this document.

21 We updated using the current executive order. Go  
22 ahead. I dropped in the specific roles and

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

1 responsibility of NACIE as detailed with the new  
2 executive order. So there's no question about what our  
3 authority is and what our role is. We drop it right into  
4 the report. Okay, next.

5 We re-labeled education, how are we doing. We  
6 cite -- well, we preface it and tie it into Secretary  
7 Haaland's study, her investigation of the boarding school  
8 issue, and that gave us the chance to even strengthen  
9 what we said last year on historical and  
10 intergenerational trauma, and tribal critical race  
11 theory in referencing it.

12 We gave a nice graphic that basically just we'll  
13 have it in narrative form and a graphic. And it basically  
14 shows the dropout rate. And one of the things I tried  
15 to do is tie it back into the 69 report.

16 While graduation has increased the dropout rate,  
17 just proportionality between Natives and non-Natives  
18 remains the same. Our dropout rate is still twice as  
19 high as the general population. So while we've made some  
20 headway we're still -- our dropout rate is still twice  
21 as high as the general population. All right, keep  
22 going.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

1 I can talk really fast too. So it's just  
2 reinforcing and putting in headers that call your  
3 attention so that if the only thing they read is the  
4 context in the beginning they'll get a good sort of  
5 orientation to our issues.

6 Okay. So we strengthened a little bit about the  
7 pandemic, and then we asked -- or we basically wanted to  
8 frame it what is our pathway back from the pandemic. And  
9 we're suggesting that we look to using technology that  
10 we might have become more adept at during the pandemic.  
11 And we don't go backwards and leave that out, that  
12 wherever it's helpful let's continue that.

13 But then that brings up the issue of broadband  
14 and connectivity. We preface it here and then Mandy  
15 gives it a better treatment in a later section. So we're  
16 just prefacing it here because in order for all this new  
17 technology to work we have to have broadband, and we have  
18 those needs still.

19 So, also the infrastructure needs were laid bare  
20 during the pandemic. So we talk about those needs in  
21 this section.

22 Wherever we are not fortunate enough to get the

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

1 infrastructure to cover some of the backlog we just make  
2 a reference to budget formulation and defaulting back to  
3 the normal appropriations process to try to address those  
4 issues.

5 All right, so the next section is on the mascot.  
6 And we had some of this embedded under climate, but we  
7 wanted to keep them separate. And so what I did was I  
8 rewrote this section, and I've been working in this space  
9 for quite awhile now. And I dropped into it the national  
10 policy standards for education administrators. And if  
11 you go down, and make a little note that these standards  
12 are incongruent with not addressing the ongoing issue of  
13 mascots, and the negative effects that they have on  
14 American Indian children, and the disservice they do to  
15 non-Native children.

16 And also I reference a Zoom link to a primer that  
17 we recently did -- well, actually it was last year, from  
18 NCAI. And it was with the assistance of NIEA. So if  
19 they click on that then they can go and see that, and  
20 actually see a presentation.

21 So we animated our report this time by actually  
22 embedding the links to make it real easy for them just

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

1 to go and click on it. They can go see directly for  
2 themselves the information.

3 And so what we're recommending here in kind of  
4 soft -- well, not soft recommending, but it's not a more  
5 strident recommendation is that we dust off that report  
6 and we see what needs to happen to be able to do a  
7 compilation of the needs for this issue.

8 We came very close in 2015. Education, the White  
9 House Initiative and NACIE collaborated, but then it got  
10 shelved. So we're asking that that be dusted off and  
11 whatever needs to happen to complete that report, that  
12 we go back and we do that.

13 MS. BUTTERFIELD: There are some typos I saw in  
14 that last section. Like that second to last paragraph  
15 you've got two prepositions, to and for.

16 DR. PAYMENT: Okay. Yes, we'll catch that. Also,  
17 when we're all done in the editing we need to replace -  
18 - we have to decide if we're using the whole White House  
19 Initiative or just say White House Initiative.

20 And also wherever we have Native we have to think  
21 about being consistent across the whole document with  
22 AIAN or Native.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

1 MS. BUTTERFIELD: I think we can use both.

2 DR. PAYMENT: Yes, well I think so too.

3 (Simultaneous speaking)

4 MS. BUTTERFIELD: -- use like Native students  
5 instead of AIAN every time.

6 DR. PAYMENT: Yes. I like Native better too.  
7 Okay, that's this section.

8 MS. BUTTERFIELD: Okay. And if you've got  
9 questions just let us know. One of the things that we  
10 did was try to give another story in this document. So  
11 instead of Theresa's story which kind of focused heavily  
12 on the pandemic we had a meeting with some folks that  
13 Ron helped us connect to and they sent us several options  
14 for stories, and this is the one that has been adapted.  
15 The full story that was written is in the -- will be in  
16 the appendix, in appendix A. So this is a modified story  
17 so it fits on one page.

18 But in here we're trying to emphasize the  
19 importance of Indian history, language, and culture, and  
20 how it can change somebody's life. So okay. So let's  
21 move on to honoring -- section 1, honoring the treaty  
22 and trust obligation. Back to you, Aaron.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

1 DR. PAYMENT: Yes. And so this section, it flows  
2 from last year, but we cleaned it up and tightened it  
3 up. We incorporated both NIEA and NCAI's recommendation  
4 to establish this position. And that's it.

5 Okay, in this one we just updated to include both  
6 the President's new executive order and consultation and  
7 the proclamation on Indigenous People's Day, and also  
8 the new White House initiative. And we included  
9 Indigenous People's Day because it includes some  
10 curriculum and some direct quotes from the President in  
11 his proclamation.

12 MS. BUTTERFIELD: So the new initiative, Aaron,  
13 is that going to be in the appendix as well?

14 DR. PAYMENT: So we have to do a little work on  
15 that. We started in the appendix listing out all the  
16 initiatives so that we have a one-stop shop for that.  
17 It might end up being two pages.

18 So one of the things we should do in the editorial  
19 review of it is go and pull out of it all the copies of  
20 all that and put it in one spot. And that would be in  
21 the appendix so they can see in one source basically a  
22 standalone.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

1           But we link them throughout the document too so  
2 they can just click it and go right to it.

3           MS. BUTTERFIELD: And while we're talking about  
4 the appendix we also added a whole section on terms. We  
5 have a lot of acronyms and stuff so we've got those in  
6 the appendix. If you read through those and find  
7 something that is really critical that's missing let us  
8 know.

9           DR. PAYMENT: Also, they're going to link the word  
10 in the appearance of the document so you'll be able to  
11 click on it and go right to the definition section. We're  
12 making this easy and animating it. So I think that's  
13 substantively it for this section.

14          MR. LESSARD: Aaron, I just had one quick comment  
15 was that not only was the proclamation signed on  
16 Indigenous People's Day but so was the executive order.

17          DR. PAYMENT: Yes. And there was a language one  
18 too that we need to make sure that we've incorporated  
19 that one as much as possible. Yes. Okay.

20          MS. ENG: Do we need a note on that to make sure  
21 that's in there?

22          DR. PAYMENT: When we get to the language section

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

1 we should drop it in there.

2 MS. ENG: Okay.

3 MS. BUTTERFIELD: Yes, good idea. I wasn't even  
4 aware there was one.

5 DR. PAYMENT: All right. And so this one again  
6 we updated -- oh, this executive order also mentioned -  
7 - supported what we were saying last year on the cross-  
8 departmental and multidisciplinary collaboration. And  
9 so we were able to strengthen the section from last year.

10 Wherever possible where we have gotten something  
11 out of the administration to give greater clarity we've  
12 embedded it in our document. Okay, this is -- this  
13 previews another section, so. This is substantively the  
14 same. All right, Robin.

15 MS. BUTTERFIELD: So we moved into adding 1.4.  
16 It wasn't in the old report, but if we're talking about  
17 infrastructure needs we need better infrastructure at  
18 the state level. So it's not just by happenstance that  
19 some states through state funding have been creating full  
20 offices of Indian education while others have nothing,  
21 or have just one person who's doing all federal programs  
22 or something.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

1           So we added in this recommendation that we need  
2           somebody at the state level to help districts across the  
3           board with all of these kinds of needs, technical  
4           assistance, curriculum, help in Title VI programs, et  
5           cetera. So we can scroll down. So this is a whole new  
6           section basically.

7           And then I did this section here talking about  
8           not just the different states but the various school  
9           districts need to ensure that Title VI is not supplanting  
10          other title programs, and if kids need high poverty --  
11          come from high-poverty communities they need that Title  
12          I funds, and then Indian ed is added over and above that,  
13          the same with bilingual, and migrant ed, special ed, you  
14          know, that Title VI is sort of a special, unique funding  
15          source that's added over and above all these others.

16          And so districts as well as the states need to  
17          make sure that Indian ed funds aren't supplanting other  
18          services that should be provided to Native students.

19          Next one, 1.6. This one was separated into two  
20          different sections from the previous report. So the  
21          first one just talks about the importance of using Native  
22          people as often as possible as professional experts and

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

1 reviewers as well as for providing technical assistance.

2 So that was what was originally there, but as I  
3 read through it, it sort of overlooked the need for just  
4 better technical assistance in general. And my -- I  
5 guess my thinking after reading through different  
6 sections of the report is in the next incarnation we  
7 could actually detail all the things that could be  
8 covered under technical assistance like checking for the  
9 supplement not supplant, curriculum integration, teacher  
10 training, special ed services. All of that stuff could  
11 be part of technical assistance but I just left it sort  
12 of generic in this report.

13 So next one, 1.8.

14 DR. PAYMENT: Okay, so for this one last year we  
15 wrote kind of an assertion to try to focus attention of  
16 the congressional members that read the report on the  
17 treaty and trust obligation to American Indians. And we  
18 were clarifying that certain properties are not  
19 principally part of that. But we -- so I think we kind  
20 of polished it up a little bit so it doesn't sound  
21 exclusionary, but it is focusing attention on the treaty  
22 and trust obligation.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

1           And so something that's happening right now that's  
2           important to note is the administration has been  
3           interpreting -- under the rubric of equity they've been  
4           qualifying some properties for services under the IHS  
5           that otherwise are technically not American Indian.

6           The example of that, and I'm not taking a side on  
7           it, is the Freedmen issue. Some Freedmen that are not  
8           actual members of tribes are directly qualifying for  
9           Indian Health Service. So given that's the tenor of some  
10          policy formulation that's happening, and also given the  
11          fact that the chair of the Senate Indian Affairs  
12          Committee is Native Hawaiian from Hawaii and the Hawaii  
13          issues, and also the vice chair is from Alaska, and the  
14          issue of ANCs which was a very controversial issue last  
15          year.

16          We're not getting in the middle of any of that.  
17          What we're saying is that a full definition, a clarity  
18          should be through tribal consultation to give us input  
19          and to count, categorically count whatever population  
20          that would fall under the general rubric of our mission.  
21          But it's not exclusionary, it's just qualifying those  
22          properties, but to reach out to tribal communities to

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

1       conduct that consultation so that clarity is established.  
2       Go down, I'll see if there's anything else.

3               MS. ENG:     Dr. Payment, can I change this to  
4       section 1.9?

5               DR. PAYMENT:  Yes.  We'll have to do that wherever  
6       it's outdated now.

7               MS. ENG:   Okay.

8               DR. PAYMENT:  I then go in and talk about the  
9       census and the chronic under count.  This is actually  
10       the BIA, the Department of Interior BIA is working on  
11       some data stuff as is the NIH and now the new HHS Center  
12       for Indigenous Data.  And so this is kind of a hot topic  
13       right now.

14               I know some of that stuff so I incorporated a  
15       little bit of it in here.  And it's just critiquing the  
16       under count, and the error rate for Indian Country.  And  
17       it's cited, too.  Critical reporting to ensure a full  
18       accounting.  Again, just what I said.  Not under  
19       counting, but categorically classifying different  
20       properties.

21               Okay, you went too far.  Creating a Native study  
22       task force.  All right.  There's lots of reasons why

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

1       there's an under count. I tried to use these sections  
2       kind of together to give an orientation.

3               And so one of the main reasons why we have an  
4       under count for American Indians is because of forced  
5       assimilation. And that came from the boarding school  
6       experience, it came from the immigrant waves, and this  
7       melting pot concept that was supposed to be idealistic  
8       but actually made people afraid to share their cultural  
9       identity. And so a lot of people don't check the box  
10      because the Dawes Severalty Act created the one quarter  
11      blood quantum requirement to be counted. And a lot of  
12      Indian people even today don't check the box if they're  
13      not at least one quarter blood because they don't feel  
14      like they're Indian enough because that was the federal  
15      policy.

16             And so these issues as they relate to historical  
17      intergenerational trauma and how that relates to student  
18      retention or dropout. So we wanted to give them a little  
19      orientation. We mentioned this last year but I think we  
20      fleshed it out a little bit better. And we directly tie  
21      it into the mission and boarding school study because  
22      that's kind of a hot topic right now. And Secretary

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

1 Haaland's report will be concluded next April so we  
2 wanted to be able to capitalize on having some messaging  
3 that kind of matches up with that.

4 And again, citing wherever -- evidence where we  
5 have in the Broken Promises report with the worst  
6 statistical outcomes.

7 Thank you, Theresa, for staying as long as you  
8 did and keeping our quorum.

9 DR. JOHN: Okay, bye bye.

10 DR. PAYMENT: Okay. And then so we wanted to just  
11 kind of -- we had this section last year, but it's  
12 accountability for data collection and assessment. And  
13 so just further qualifying that we want to continue to  
14 collect data from NCES and from the National Center for  
15 Education Statistics, but that there's some attention  
16 that really needs to be focused on operationalizing how  
17 we're counting, and potentially expanding who we're  
18 counting. Right now we do kind of a sampling, and I  
19 think it needs improvement because it's an under count.  
20 Okay, Robin.

21 MS. BUTTERFIELD: Oh, sure.

22 DR. PROUDFIT: In that capacity we have to put

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

1 California in there.

2 DR. PAYMENT: Oh, yes.

3 DR. PROUDFIT: Just because we have 40 million  
4 people living in California, but we have 1.5 which is -  
5 - million American Indians living in California. That  
6 survey or that study not counting California is really  
7 harming us.

8 DR. PAYMENT: So let's -- can you give me like  
9 maybe, can you think it to two or three sentences and  
10 I'll embed it.

11 DR. PROUDFIT: Absolutely.

12 DR. PAYMENT: Good deal. That's right, that's  
13 our best example because it's the largest disparity in  
14 one state.

15 MS. SMOKER-BROADDUS: Aaron, Dr. Payment,  
16 anywhere in there do you specifically call out the mixed  
17 race category? Because when I talk to states, and school  
18 districts, and tribes that's the single biggest barrier  
19 (telephonic interference) decreasing the numbers  
20 significantly.

21 DR. PAYMENT: Yes. It's included in the census  
22 section, but if you could take a look at that and then

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

1 look at this section. And if we need to reinforce it in  
2 both sections then we can.

3 MS. SMOKER-BROADDUS: Okay.

4 DR. PAYMENT: Yes, you're right. You're right  
5 because remember during the Reagan era, just say no to  
6 drugs, there was also -- that was when the Hispanic term  
7 was really strong. And all of that was supposedly to  
8 make people feel inclusive, but it created more confusion  
9 than it actually helped because it caused people who  
10 didn't already identify as a member of a federally  
11 recognized tribe to consider themselves as mixed.

12 And we're all mixed, right. And so some people  
13 don't check the right box because -- and if you look at  
14 the outcome of the 2020 Census that population grew much  
15 faster, 160 percent growth than did the population -- we  
16 had a 27 percent increase over the 10 years from the  
17 federally recognized tribal members who identify as  
18 federally recognized. But then you got this gigantic  
19 increase in the mixed blood. And whether they're  
20 actually Indian or not is questionable, but some of that  
21 is because of that lingering sort of melting pot concept.  
22 So we'll add those. If you send them I'll incorporate

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

1 it.

2 MS. BUTTERFIELD: Okay. Thanks, Aaron. So there  
3 are three subsections under languages. And I asked Ron  
4 to review them all. He's been working with a cadre of  
5 language teachers.

6 I would suggest, and I didn't do this, I  
7 apologize. Under the recommendations section, it's in  
8 dark print, that we just leave the recommendation and  
9 end it at lifelong learning, that first sentence. And  
10 then -- so you can take that last long sentence and move  
11 it down. I think it fits best under the rationale, after  
12 the first two paragraphs. So that whole section can be  
13 moved down into the rationale, and then that would  
14 shorten the recommendation. Because there are multiple  
15 recommendations in this section as it is. So right  
16 before -- yes, right there.

17 DR. PAYMENT: The committee, the way the document  
18 is structured is it has the recommendations in the body,  
19 but it -- they put a macro in that will pull it right up  
20 to the top. So if the congressional office only reads  
21 the highlight they're going to get the essentials.

22 So what we've been trying to do, and what we will

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

1 do after we're done here today is pay attention to trying  
2 to make that recommendation as succinct as possible, and  
3 then embed the explanation in the narrative.

4 MS. BUTTERFIELD: Right. So, how did that get so  
5 long. Okay.

6 DR. PAYMENT: There.

7 MS. BUTTERFIELD: And I think we can make a break  
8 in this long paragraph right after communities, where it  
9 says Congress should acknowledge and insist. Yes, right  
10 there. That could be a new paragraph. There we go.

11 So, I think basically I mostly wordsmithed some  
12 of this stuff, and we made sure we had the correct  
13 executive order and stuff in this section. And then in  
14 the next one we kept that section because some places  
15 still talk about Native languages as qualifying as world  
16 languages. That one we didn't change a whole lot. Or  
17 the certification. Let's see, certification of language  
18 speakers. That one is still fairly consistent with the  
19 previous report.

20 So, moving into section 2 where we start talking  
21 about funding. In this section that talks about the  
22 distinction between Title VI and Johnson-O'Malley I

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

1 separated the paragraphs so that there's one that  
2 basically talks about what is Title VI, and then the  
3 second one, when did it start, what is its focus, who  
4 oversees it.

5 And then the second one talks about the Indian Ed  
6 Act and the same thing. When did it start, what's its  
7 purpose. So that it just clarifies the distinction  
8 between the two so that all these efforts over the years  
9 to combine them doesn't really make sense because they  
10 serve multiple purposes and different ones from different  
11 agencies. So they are not duplicative is basically what  
12 I'm trying to emphasize there. Okay.

13 MS. ENG: Should we add this Indian Education Act  
14 of (telephonic interference) should we put this in the  
15 appendix as well?

16 MS. BUTTERFIELD: Yes, if it isn't in there. It  
17 should be.

18 DR. PAYMENT: Like a link you mean to it so they  
19 can go look at it themselves? Yes.

20 MS. BUTTERFIELD: Yes. Yes, that was the very  
21 first Indian Ed Act in 1972.

22 MS. ENG: Okay.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

1 MS. BUTTERFIELD: Okay. Yes, I'm glad you caught  
2 that. Okay, so then 2.2 is talking about the commitment  
3 for the uniqueness of the Title VI program and what it  
4 does. I did edit that quite a bit.

5 And what I tried to do in this one was also kind  
6 of reinforce some of the other stuff in the context in  
7 that. When Title VI was funded it provided a huge number  
8 of other services which have all been dropped. Key among  
9 those is technical assistance. We used to have six  
10 technical assistance centers, and it used to fund Native  
11 students going into teaching. There used to be a  
12 scholarship program. There used to be an adult basic ed  
13 program.

14 So we have lost a lot over time just in the  
15 services that Title VI could fund. So it definitely  
16 needs to be funded adequately. And so down on the chart  
17 at the bottom of this section we were hoping to find at  
18 least the projected funds for this next fiscal year.

19 So then we're moving on to the tribal colleges,  
20 and I think it's back to you, Aaron.

21 DR. PAYMENT: Okay. So this one, we updated it  
22 and we checked on some things to make sure they were

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

1 correct and they are. And also I reference some of the  
2 legislation that has been drafted, not approved yet, and  
3 some funding that's included in the Build Back Better.  
4 So it's basically -- and I also dropped it to a little  
5 bit about the loan burden, and distinguish gift  
6 assistance versus loan burden because that's at the heart  
7 of why there's proposed increases in tribal colleges.

8 And this is all sourced. So it's directly  
9 sourced. Plus I wanted to drop this in because it's  
10 significant. The President -- the First Lady has -- Dr.  
11 Biden has a background in community college, and she's -  
12 - you can see it's coming out because she's been to three  
13 different tribal colleges already to check out the tribal  
14 college situation and from what I understand the White  
15 House has a big chunk of money, I think it's going to be  
16 over \$800 million that's going to be proposed for  
17 increases for tribal colleges. So I wanted to reference  
18 that in here.

19 And then we go to data collection. So, this is a  
20 space that I've focused on for my whole career, and it's  
21 to improve understanding, retention, and matriculation  
22 of Native students in non-Native serving institutions.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

1 So, rather than just leaving us to sink or swim out there  
2 we're asking for Education to have some effort to try to  
3 dialogue, bring together compendiums of information,  
4 colloquiums, and try to better understand some of the  
5 retention issues.

6 So this actually ties directly into my  
7 dissertation topic. So I pulled from it liberally and  
8 referenced some of the different theories that impact.  
9 So, but we need a comprehensive review of what those  
10 factors are and those issues are that either promote or  
11 discourage graduation. Data-driven retention services.

12 And then down here we reference accountability  
13 scorecard. So what's different between us and everybody  
14 else is there's a federal right to have education, a  
15 treaty right to have education. And so we would like to  
16 know how well the federal government is doing. And so  
17 it's not -- it is fair, it is fair to ask for some  
18 accountability scorecard on these different factors. So,  
19 all right.

20 And mitigating the expense of higher education.  
21 This is where I was talking about addressing gift  
22 assistance versus loan burden, and then the focus on the

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

1 Pell grant. I also did this very specifically for a  
2 reason because in the Build Back Better there are -- this  
3 administration, the Biden administration is aware and  
4 because of the campaign there was a lot of talk about  
5 free college, free two-year college. And so I kind of  
6 stayed away from that rhetoric, but I did focus on the  
7 parts about increasing Pell grants. And there is a big  
8 chunk of money in the Build Back Better proposed for Pell  
9 grants, increasing Pell grants.

10 Then I dropped in some legislation that also  
11 supports increasing Pell grants. So we're agnostic about  
12 it. We know we need more money. We'll take it whether  
13 it's in Build Back Better or if it's some standalone  
14 legislation, but we're just referencing that we know that  
15 additional funds are needed. Pell grant has not kept  
16 pace with the cost of living.

17 So, oh this is just a little more detail about  
18 some of the theories and how they come together to  
19 provoke thought about the need to better understand why  
20 -- we have -- not only do we have some of the worst  
21 graduation rates, or the highest dropout rates at the K-  
22 12 level, it also remains true at the college level. So

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

1 it's time for us to understand that better, and once we  
2 understand it better then we can fashion initiatives or  
3 interventions to be able to retain Native students at a  
4 greater rate. That's it.

5 MS. BUTTERFIELD: Okay, thanks Aaron. So the next  
6 section is all on Title VII impact aid, and that's over  
7 to you, Dr. Dennison.

8 DR. JACKSON-DENNISON: Okay, thank you all. This  
9 is pretty much up to date as far as what has happened in  
10 impact aid. I think the major change is the -- if we go  
11 down to the -- it's explaining what 700, all the impact  
12 aid is the seven hundreds. And so the changes with the  
13 -- right here, Congress. Okay, supporting -- go back  
14 up. Go back up.

15 Explaining why the Congress needs to ensure --  
16 wait. You keep moving me around, I'm getting dizzy.  
17 Okay. Where were we. A little bit lower. I mean, go  
18 down a little bit. The full funding. We connected it  
19 back to the HR-5255 that would -- and then making certain  
20 that there's the funding formula. There's enough funding  
21 for Native students through impact aid, or the ISEP  
22 formula, that it's increased for all students throughout.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

1 So that's one of the things that we've added.

2 And then we also talked about the learning  
3 opportunity threshold because those of us that are  
4 involved with public school, impact aid schools, we take  
5 it for granted everybody knows and so that is something  
6 that I think it's defined in the definitions as well.

7 MS. ENG: It is.

8 DR. JACKSON-DENNISON: Okay.

9 DR. PAYMENT: Hey, Dr. D? I apologize. I see up  
10 there where I had -- there was a notation. I think it  
11 was after I left last Friday. But I'll go back and read  
12 through it. It looks like you want me to add some  
13 language to call for consultation. And I can go back  
14 and add one or two sentences.

15 DR. JACKSON-DENNISON: That will work.

16 MS. BUTTERFIELD: Can we go back up to number A  
17 just real briefly? I think, or wait, no. It's B, I'm  
18 sorry. Let's go down to B. I think the part that's in  
19 blue, if we could abbreviate that so -- because you've  
20 got the recommendation. I think it needs to be much more  
21 succinct. Usually the titles for the sections are only  
22 like one line.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

1 DR. JACKSON-DENNISON: Yes.

2 MS. BUTTERFIELD: So if we could just make that,  
3 you know, maybe provide the increases to the ISEP  
4 formula.

5 DR. JACKSON-DENNISON: I think that should go  
6 somewhere else because ISEP is totally -- but then we  
7 were talking about how again it goes back to our number  
8 one recommendation, how at the top they don't -- there's  
9 not clarity as to the different formulas, whether it's  
10 impact aid or ISEP, the two major formulas that fund  
11 students on Indian --

12 MS. BUTTERFIELD: Well, all I'm saying is can you  
13 come up with like a one-sentence basically that  
14 encompasses this section? I mean, it shouldn't be like  
15 six lines long. And then if you want to add some of that  
16 to the recommendation section that would probably fit  
17 better, just so it's consistent with the way the other  
18 recommendations are formatted. So maybe you could take  
19 that second sentence basically.

20 DR. JACKSON-DENNISON: Oh, that would be another  
21 -- would be C probably, right?

22 MS. BUTTERFIELD: If that's a whole separate

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

1 section, is that what you're saying? Because you're  
2 talking about the ISEP formula.

3 DR. JACKSON-DENNISON: It's talking about full  
4 funding, yes. The first one is too -- no matter their  
5 educational setting are provided the resources. That  
6 would be a recommendation then, the highlighted area.  
7 So maybe you should just ends on retention, period, and  
8 then that is moved down to -- in the rationale.

9 MS. BUTTERFIELD: I just think you can probably  
10 stop the -- under B right after quality of education.  
11 Or if you want to go to retention.

12 DR. JACKSON-DENNISON: Okay, yes.

13 MS. BUTTERFIELD: It just seems (telephonic  
14 interference) that's all I'm saying.

15 DR. JACKSON-DENNISON: Okay. Let me look it over  
16 and I'll change that around.

17 MS. BUTTERFIELD: Yes, okay.

18 MS. ENG: Yes, because you also talk about  
19 advancing toward the impact aid down here in your  
20 recommendation.

21 MS. BUTTERFIELD: Right.

22 (Simultaneous speaking)

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

1 MS. BUTTERFIELD: -- needs to be shorter, that's  
2 all.

3 DR. JACKSON-DENNISON: Okay, I'll work on that.  
4 The rest of it is pretty much explaining lot and how  
5 we've been at the low end -- we've never been full funded.  
6 And then it goes down into the -- this is where it's  
7 changed is the repealing section, 7009, because New  
8 Mexico fell out of equalized. And so it's just Alaska  
9 and Kansas. And I think Alaska is falling out too, or  
10 was it staying the same. One of them is staying the same  
11 and one of them -- oh, Kansas remains equalized but  
12 Alaska formula is currently in question.

13 So, those are the major states that were really -  
14 - equalize isn't the right, from the state's point of  
15 view they're equalized across the state. Every student  
16 costs the same amount to educate. But it's really  
17 unequal because -- that's what it's really explaining is  
18 that it's really unequal when they're equalized. It's  
19 really an unequal education when they're equalized across  
20 the state because impact aid's purpose is to equalize  
21 up, not equalize across. So that's the difference  
22 between it all.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

1           Then on the construction and renovation of  
2 facilities, 7007, it's always just been a very minimal  
3 amount that we get according to -- compared to other  
4 schools across the country. So we're just saying that -  
5 - I mean, impact aid was left off the new law, the new  
6 legislation, and so we're saying that it should be -- we  
7 still have the same problems and yet we were left off  
8 and we're asking to -- we're showing the data here, how  
9 many students and how many schools are served, schools  
10 are serving Native students and those buildings are --  
11 some of them are literally falling apart at the seams  
12 pretty much. And yet they're still being used. So it's  
13 really hard to -- when you're not getting 100 percent  
14 and you're having to -- so then we go into the impact  
15 aid study below that needs to happen.

16           Again, my whole feeling on this, and I know it's  
17 because I come from the background of public schools,  
18 that people don't understand. We say it in the very  
19 beginning, people at the top don't really understand  
20 Indian education. They don't really understand it, the  
21 demographics of it. And it's hard to -- when we have  
22 someone there in Washington that's over the BIE and

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

1 they're always there. We have Julian but he's over the  
2 -- mainly the grants. I don't know if he gets invited  
3 into the -- how often he gets invited to talk to the  
4 superintendent of the -- secretary of Education. That's  
5 the difference. So, I know someone's always testifying  
6 on the BIE's behalf, but then I don't know who testifies  
7 on our behalf when situations are like this. That's  
8 where the difference is.

9 DR. PAYMENT: This is really good to give them a  
10 one-stop shop to understand this in the public space.  
11 So it's excellent.

12 MS. BUTTERFIELD: Yes, I think over time we've  
13 all come to understand impact aid, but it is a confusing  
14 area for a lot of other folks, that those dollars are in  
15 lieu of the tax base.

16 DR. JACKSON-DENNISON: It's not even Indian  
17 education money. That's what people don't understand  
18 too. It's in lieu of the tax base that doesn't exist.  
19 And I'm always arguing with the different people that I  
20 have to deal with locally that say we have to pay tribal  
21 taxes to some extent. And I'm like well, you better be  
22 careful because are you able to make up the difference

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

1 of impact aid if we get that taken away. That's really  
2 the concern that I always have.

3 MS. BUTTERFIELD: Yes. Okay, so moving on to  
4 section 3 here again this is when I keep talking about  
5 the need for technical assistance. What I've kind of  
6 written in here is that if we could identify promising  
7 practices and share them across the board there's really  
8 very minimal infrastructures to be able to do that. And  
9 so when we lost all of our Title VI funding for Indian  
10 ed we lost infrastructure that worked at one time. So  
11 just in general all the technical assistance that we  
12 receive goes from comp centers to states and not to LEAs.  
13 And there's no guarantee that even if a state has chosen  
14 to really focus efforts on Indian education that they  
15 are capable or competent to do all the work that's needed  
16 to improve Native schools. So the need for A is huge in  
17 Indian Country. It's really huge. So that's that  
18 section. Okay, early childhood.

19 DR. JACKSON-DENNISON: I didn't really touch on  
20 this. Patricia did the last one and I thought it was  
21 pretty good. But I got to thinking in the middle of the  
22 night over the weekend that Native philosophy of when

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

1 education really starts, it starts in the womb. So I  
2 mean, maybe in the next report we can add something like  
3 that in this area. But I left it the same as Patricia  
4 had worked on it in the last report.

5 MS. BUTTERFIELD: And maybe by the time we do the  
6 next report we'll have more information on Build Back  
7 Better because they're supposed to be putting a lot of  
8 focus on pre-K.

9 DR. JACKSON-DENNISON: Right. That's true.

10 DR. PAYMENT: Yes, I understand it's going to be  
11 \$1 billion.

12 DR. JACKSON-DENNISON: Wow.

13 MS. BUTTERFIELD: Yes, we need to be advocating  
14 for that. Okay. Parent engagement. I left it much the  
15 same. I did the report for the Indian nations at risk  
16 on parent engagement. So I tried to just emphasize that  
17 the research says if we could get parents engaged it  
18 improves almost every variable in schools, attendance,  
19 student attitude towards school, direct learning if  
20 they're working directly with the parents, all that kind  
21 of stuff.

22 There's a huge need to be intentional about parent

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

1 engagement because it was intentional to remove parents  
2 from the education process back in the day. So that's a  
3 huge need in Indian Country. Technology. Mandy.

4 MS. SMOKER-BROADDUS: Well, I tried to sort of  
5 rework this section, but I'm wondering now because Aaron  
6 talked about so much of it in the infrastructure piece  
7 up above. It's really -- I mean, there's two pieces,  
8 right. There's a piece about connectivity and broadband,  
9 but then also the piece about do you actually have the  
10 tools you need, especially highlighted during COVID. So  
11 I don't know if -- I mean, it's fine here, but I feel  
12 like we're kind of repeating ourselves a little bit. But  
13 whatever you guys think.

14 DR. PAYMENT: Yes, what I tried to do was just to  
15 preview it because if all they see is the first part.  
16 But -- because this is a hot topic right now, right,  
17 broadband, connectivity, pandemic. I don't think it's  
18 duplicative. I think I can potentially kind of condense  
19 it down a little bit up in the annual report, and then  
20 reference the page that it's on. Because this section  
21 is really good in laying out what's needed.

22 MS. BUTTERFIELD: Yes. I was going to say --

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

1 because this is the recommendation section. The other  
2 is the context section which might overlap some with the  
3 rationale part of it. But this is -- we actually need  
4 to really highlight the technology needs because they're  
5 huge in Indian Country. So I don't think they're too -  
6 - I don't think they're duplicative at all really.

7 (Simultaneous speaking)

8 MS. SMOKER-BROADDUS: Should I add more?

9 DR. PAYMENT: If there's something more than --  
10 because we might want to say a little bit more with. All  
11 right, so if you follow it through it's a matter of the  
12 software that's out there, the support that's out there  
13 and the broadband that allows that to happen. But also  
14 the interface with the child, what is that. Is it a  
15 computer? Is it a tablet, a laptop? What kind of  
16 technology could make that even more conducive to them  
17 actually using it. So that's one piece that we might  
18 want to strengthen.

19 MS. BUTTERFIELD: You might want to add something  
20 on just staff preparation, you know. Do we have the  
21 expertise in Indian Country to help the kids use the  
22 equipment the way they should.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

1 DR. PAYMENT: Oh yes. Yes, they show us how to  
2 use it.

3 MS. BUTTERFIELD: Usually, yes, thank God. I have  
4 my kids. So yes, so professional development might be  
5 one of the areas where the funds could be used as well.  
6 And do all our kids even have computers. I don't think  
7 so. Or even cell phones, you know.

8 DR. PAYMENT: You know, this new -- for the \$1  
9 billion that was allocated out, when they did the RFP  
10 process, the application process the tribes  
11 oversubscribe -- that's a term I never used before. They  
12 oversubscribed, which means that they identified \$5  
13 billion worth of need. So that's why the administration,  
14 when they included the \$2 billion more in the  
15 infrastructure bill it's looking at pushing out \$1.2 of  
16 that out the same way that they did the first round to  
17 fill some of the holes that they aren't going to be able  
18 to fund in the first round.

19 There's some talk about pushing some  
20 automatically out because they give a half a million.  
21 Every tribe got a half a million under the broadband  
22 bill. And those, the competitive part of it, the

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

1 application part of it, it does allow for applying for  
2 tablets, and how does somebody interface with the  
3 broadband. So yes.

4 So now would be a good time for us to say, you  
5 know, to make the connection complete we have to have a  
6 way for the child to interface with this new service.

7 MS. BUTTERFIELD: Yes.

8 DR. JACKSON-DENNISON: Yes. I think one of the  
9 challenges that we're having, and I know it's not just  
10 down in southern Arizona where I work, but it's also up  
11 north and the tribes up north are having is that there's  
12 a monopoly, and when there's broadband coming across the  
13 area to the non-Native school systems they get it but  
14 there's a monopoly on the reservations. It's not  
15 something that Congress can handle, but I'm just sharing  
16 that. It really creates a more uneven disparity because  
17 the local technology company has a monopoly over. And  
18 so it's very, very hard to deal with -- I don't know  
19 where we would say that, but it's just something that  
20 I'm sharing with you that really hurts us.

21 MS. BUTTERFIELD: Yes.

22 DR. PAYMENT: Yes, so Dr. D, what they're going

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

1 to try to do is in the next round -- and also in a round  
2 of funding that's available through USDA is tribes were  
3 pushing during the consultation that they include  
4 language for funding that's not just funding for tribes,  
5 but also funding that is for states, territories and  
6 tribes.

7 And so there's going to be language included that  
8 will create incentives for local governments and private  
9 industry to collaborate with tribes. Because then you  
10 can match these dollars over here with the tribal dollars  
11 over here.

12 The only way broadband is really going to work is  
13 for public-private partnerships to make that connection.  
14 And so we were successful in getting them to include  
15 language in the appropriations that says states,  
16 territories and tribes so we can try to pull that  
17 together. Otherwise it is at the whim of private  
18 industry.

19 MS. BUTTERFIELD: Okay. Just moving along because  
20 we're getting close to the end. The last section that I  
21 did is the one on just (telephonic interference) we're  
22 moving past it. Can you back up to the last

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

1 recommendation section under 3? This again was looking  
2 at school climate. And that encompasses a lot of things.

3 This is where we took out the section about  
4 mascots because all we had in there was a letter of  
5 recommendation which Congress doesn't do that. So we  
6 had to focus it on what would Congress do or could do to  
7 work on improving school climate.

8 And I think this again speaks to the need of  
9 technical assistance because there's so many areas,  
10 teacher quality, that kind of professional development.  
11 Disciplinary practices impacts climate. Having  
12 wraparound services and addressing historical trauma.  
13 Attendance issues. We've got a whole program just on  
14 improving Native student attendance. So it's a huge area  
15 that has many parts, and so if we could even just get a  
16 study to explore what those strategies are because there  
17 is stuff existing. Working at Northwest over the years  
18 we went and worked with whole schools at a time to do a  
19 circular school improvement process that really made a  
20 difference with those schools. But it's sort of a  
21 comprehensive approach. So if we could study that and  
22 make some recommendations down the road that would

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

1 strengthen this one a lot.

2 Okay, section 4. Back to you, Dr. Payment.  
3 You're on mute.

4 DR. PAYMENT: We included this one last year and  
5 it's even stronger now because of the President's new  
6 executive order and giving a deadline. After the Obama-  
7 Biden administration the GAO did a report and they  
8 reported that only 60 percent of the agencies and  
9 departments actually complied with the President's  
10 order.

11 And so President Biden gave a deadline, 90 days.  
12 And that's why tribes were inundated for the first eight  
13 months of this administration. Over 50 consultations  
14 were held. We were able to actually just make this a  
15 little stronger and to tie it in to -- and give back a  
16 little bit of the history.

17 But then it ties back into the Every Student  
18 Succeeds Act included language, we worked really hard to  
19 get language in there for states to conduct consultations  
20 on curriculum and language assessments. And during the  
21 whole four years of the last administration remember we  
22 couldn't even get reports about what was happening or

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

1       how they were doing.

2               And so this just ties it all back together again,  
3       and how we really need to be -- really Congress should  
4       be conducting oversight on the implementation.    But  
5       certainly in our space and the role that we have as NACIE  
6       we would like to see how we're progressing.    Because if  
7       we're not progressing we might urge the Secretary of  
8       Education to do a guidance letter to facilitate states  
9       to actually follow through with ESSA and to conduct those  
10      consultations.

11              On the other end of this is more informed  
12      curriculum that is steeped in our experience.    That is  
13      referenced in the President's proclamation on Indigenous  
14      People's Day.    And so we really did I think tried to pull  
15      all that together.    And so this section was strengthened  
16      based on President Biden's additional level of a  
17      commitment to consultation.

18              MS. BUTTERFIELD:    Aaron, under this section do  
19      you reference Appendix B where you have the graphic on  
20      the consultations framework?

21              DR. PAYMENT:    Yes.    Yes.

22              MS. BUTTERFIELD:    Where is it?

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

1 DR. PAYMENT: It's right there.

2 MS. BUTTERFIELD: Oh, there it is, okay.

3 DR. PAYMENT: And whoever did the little magic  
4 did an amazing job. I appreciate it. It looks way  
5 better than the rudimentary chart that I had.

6 MS. ENG: I will let the graphic designer know  
7 that. Thank you.

8 MS. BUTTERFIELD: So, I did have one thought about  
9 this last section. I almost thought it might start the  
10 report as opposed to end the report.

11 DR. PAYMENT: I like that idea. I do.

12 MS. BUTTERFIELD: That's, you know, because we  
13 start off in the beginning talking about infrastructure  
14 within the Department of Ed elevating the position. But  
15 even before we have that the most important item is  
16 always consulting on federal policy. So, it's just a  
17 thought.

18 The other thing is that we only have one  
19 recommendation under this one so it almost seems like -  
20 - unless we have multiple recommendations that. I mean  
21 it could be a standalone as number 1. Anyway, I was just  
22 thinking about that.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

1 DR. PAYMENT: I'm all for it. The only thing I  
2 will tell you because I've shared a lot. I've shared a  
3 lot about myself that I never thought I would but I'm  
4 OCD so I get nervous even thinking about moving it. So  
5 if somebody can move it up there so we can see -- not  
6 right now because I don't want to go into a tizzy, but  
7 if they can move it to see what it looks like then we  
8 can -- I think flowing from consultation because it flows  
9 from the very first action in Indian Country that Biden  
10 issued was the consultation policy. So if we put that  
11 up towards the beginning everything else that's read  
12 flows from that. So I think that makes sense.

13 MS. BUTTERFIELD: Yes.

14 (Simultaneous speaking)

15 MS. BUTTERFIELD: -- start off talking about trust  
16 responsibility and that's, you know, true consultation.

17 MS. ENG: So should we make this roman numeral I  
18 and then this would be 1.1, and then everything else will  
19 be renumbered after that? Is that what we're saying?  
20 Okay.

21 MS. BUTTERFIELD: Yes.

22 MS. ENG: We'll do that today, and then we can

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

1 send it out tonight and you guys can take a look at it  
2 and approve.

3 MS. BUTTERFIELD: Yes, because in the place now  
4 it almost looks like an afterthought and it should be  
5 more important than that. So then that makes -- I mean  
6 we have sort of three basic areas, improving  
7 infrastructure, funding, and what was the last one. I  
8 don't remember the key heading, but yes. Okay, I like  
9 that idea.

10 So then for the good of the order we have the  
11 appendix and the appendix is really beefed up from  
12 before. Go ahead, Aaron.

13 DR. PAYMENT: Oh, just I updated this section a  
14 little bit.

15 MS. BUTTERFIELD: Oh, okay.

16 DR. PAYMENT: There's not too much though.  
17 Otherwise it's principally the same as last year.

18 MS. BUTTERFIELD: So we do have some memos that  
19 we included. We've also got the glossary of terms which  
20 is very extensive. And I really appreciate the work that  
21 the staff has done in pulling this together. It's  
22 awesome.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

1           I think these are tools that lots of programs and  
2 organizations can benefit from. So.

3           DR. PAYMENT: So Robin, I would just add that in  
4 the edits if we could, whoever's doing the fly spec'ing  
5 -- the final edits is pull out anything that --  
6 especially if it's somebody that's not deeply in the  
7 Indian education space. You come across something that  
8 you're not quite sure. If we have links to it let's drop  
9 it in.

10           I'm thinking if Appendix C ends up being one or  
11 two pages of links then I'm thinking about the staffer  
12 that sits at the desk in the congressional office that  
13 says I know right where to find that. That's in the  
14 appendix. And they can go and get it and they can click  
15 on it.

16           So if we can read back through the document for  
17 any links that we should provide here. And it would be  
18 the presidential memos, the executive orders, the new  
19 interagency MOU. Just make it available for them in one  
20 spot.

21           MS. ENG: Okay. Should we provide the link and  
22 the reference in the order that it appears in the

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

1 document, or should we put it in alphabetical order?

2 DR. PAYMENT: Probably alphabetical order.

3 MS. ENG: Okay.

4 MS. BUTTERFIELD: Yes, I'm okay with either, so.  
5 We'll leave it to our OCD person. Thank goodness.

6 DR. PAYMENT: And there's our terms. You know  
7 what, after somebody reads this report they're going to  
8 be an expert.

9 MS. BUTTERFIELD: Yes, I know it. That's what I  
10 thought too. I just had a process question and it deals  
11 with the story in the appendix. Do we need to get  
12 approval from Loretta Salazar that we've modified her  
13 story, and is she okay with it? Do we need to do that?

14 MS. ENG: I think we probably should.

15 MS. BUTTERFIELD: Is that something maybe Ron,  
16 you could do?

17 DR. PAYMENT: Are you still there, Ron?

18 MR. LESSARD: I'm still here. That was Salazar's  
19 story did you say?

20 MS. BUTTERFIELD: Yes. It's in two places. The  
21 full unedited version is in the appendix, but we've  
22 edited so it would fit on one page in the earlier part

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

1 of the document. I just want to be sure that we've  
2 acknowledged her and let her know that that's the case.

3 MR. LESSARD: Okay, sure.

4 MS. BUTTERFIELD: So if she gets a copy and reads  
5 the edited story she might be offended. I don't know.

6 MR. LESSARD: I'm happy to do that. I'll get a  
7 hold of Dede Yazzie and let her know. And yes.

8 MS. BUTTERFIELD: Okay, that would be great.

9 MS. ENG: Ron, should I send you a version that  
10 has the edits, like the highlighted edits so she knows  
11 where it's changed?

12 MR. LESSARD: Yes, sure. Yes, that would be  
13 great.

14 MS. ENG: Okay, I'll do that today. Or tomorrow  
15 morning.

16 MR. LESSARD: And just the justification was just  
17 because of length?

18 MS. BUTTERFIELD: Length. To be succinct, and  
19 yet we still have the full story available. But yes,  
20 it's more trying to highlight the most important, salient  
21 parts.

22 MR. LESSARD: I think that will be fine. I'll

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

1 let them know.

2 MS. BUTTERFIELD: Great. That was a loose end I  
3 just thought of. It's like getting permissions for  
4 pictures.

5 MR. LESSARD: Yes.

6 MS. BUTTERFIELD: And thank her profusely for  
7 getting that to us in such a timely manner. That was  
8 quite a request.

9 MR. LESSARD: That was a great meeting with Dede  
10 Yazzie and the folks from Phoenix.

11 MS. BUTTERFIELD: Yes.

12 DR. PAYMENT: Good deal.

13 MS. BUTTERFIELD: Okay, so I can turn this I guess  
14 back over to Deborah. Are there any -- well, maybe we  
15 should talk about the review process and timelines.

16 MS. ENG: Hold on, let me bring up the calendar.

17 MS. BUTTERFIELD: Yes.

18 DR. JACKSON-DENNISON: Sure, thank you.

19 MS. ENG: So we are here. Monday, the 13th. And  
20 then what I have is final comments to me by noon tomorrow.  
21 And then we'll put all the edits together, incorporate  
22 all the edits, and then send it back to NACIE by the end

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

1 of the day. And then we would like approval by Wednesday  
2 at 9 p.m. And then it goes to the copy editor and they  
3 have two days with it. We'll recover the copy edits  
4 unless somebody else wants to recover them.

5 DR. PAYMENT: Hey Shirley? I would just not use  
6 the term approval because we've already approved it. So  
7 just say final edits.

8 MS. BUTTERFIELD: Yes. And does -- who is  
9 following up with the DOE folks? The Department of Ed  
10 review. Is that something Julian would collect, or does  
11 it go to you? Angela or who?

12 MS. ENG: I think Angela.

13 MS. HERNANDEZ: Yes. Sorry about that. Robin,  
14 we expect to have the comments this afternoon.

15 MS. BUTTERFIELD: Okay.

16 MS. HERNANDEZ: And they'll be incorporated into  
17 the comments that you guys will get from Shirley  
18 tomorrow.

19 MS. BUTTERFIELD: Okay. If there's anything --  
20 I'm just thinking if there was anything major then maybe  
21 the subcommittee needs to get an email or something.

22 MS. HERNANDEZ: I will definitely let Julian know

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

1 that. I can tell you now that for the most part what  
2 I've heard so far preliminarily is that they're primarily  
3 editorial and pretty similar to last year just in terms  
4 of combining certain sections, you know. Streamlining  
5 if you will. But that's it. But nothing substantive  
6 that I've heard.

7 MS. BUTTERFIELD: Okay, well that's good.

8 DR. PAYMENT: Wonderful.

9 MS. ENG: So as it stands now the NACIE  
10 subcommittee members will have two reviews, one on  
11 Wednesday before it goes to the copy editor, and then  
12 one on Monday before it goes to 508 remediation. And  
13 our hope is to get the -- turn around the final document  
14 by Thursday end of business.

15 DR. PAYMENT: Do we have meetings scheduled to do  
16 that, or it's just through comments through email?

17 MS. HERNANDEZ: We have not set anything. That's  
18 at your subcommittee's discretion.

19 DR. PAYMENT: My recommendation would just be --  
20 because it seems like we're at the home stretch, is if  
21 we just circulate and make any comments if necessary.

22 MS. BUTTERFIELD: So that means that we would get

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

1 two more copies, one after the copy editor, and then --

2 MS. ENG: One before the copy editor, and one  
3 before the 508 remediation.

4 MS. BUTTERFIELD: Okay. Yes.

5 DR. JACKSON-DENNISON: Okay. I think that looks  
6 good.

7 DR. PAYMENT: Happy, happy, joy, joy.

8 MS. BUTTERFIELD: Yes.

9 DR. JACKSON-DENNISON: Yes. Are there any  
10 questions from any of the other members of NACIE that  
11 you want to say or anything, comments or questions?  
12 Okay. Anybody else that's on the subcommittee?

13 I want to just say that I'm really thankful. It  
14 just looks so much better, and I'm really grateful to  
15 the -- to Shirley and your crew, and Aaron and Robin.  
16 You guys really added some juice to it all and made it  
17 really -- it is, it's a very educational document. And  
18 it is a great effort from everyone that worked on this.  
19 It just makes so much more meaning to it. It is something  
20 that you can use to teach a class about Indian education  
21 and what the issues are, and what the practitioners of  
22 Indian education which is all of us that are on this

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

1 council, what we see and believe, and what we hear, and  
2 what we know to be -- what will make a difference. And  
3 so I just want to say thank you to all of you.

4 MS. BUTTERFIELD: There is one question, Dr.  
5 Dennison, about when the document would be accessible to  
6 others.

7 DR. JACKSON-DENNISON: Yes. I think Angela  
8 answered that on the chat, that it would be accessible  
9 as soon as it's approved -- I mean, as soon as it's --  
10 it will be on the webpage. It's always posted on the  
11 NACIE, on the Department of Education -- not DODE, that's  
12 Navajo Nation. The Department of Education webpage. It  
13 will be where it usually is.

14 MS. BUTTERFIELD: Right.

15 DR. PAYMENT: Good deal.

16 DR. JACKSON-DENNISON: And it's public. Yes.

17 MS. BUTTERFIELD: And then will the final be  
18 mailed out to all of us?

19 MS. HERNANDEZ: Yes.

20 DR. JACKSON-DENNISON: It should be.

21 (Simultaneous speaking)

22 DR. JACKSON-DENNISON: -- anytime I could get to

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

1 -- in a conference or somewhere where we have quite a  
2 few Native educators. I would just give it out. I've  
3 been giving them out. I had our last DFO give me a bunch  
4 of copies the last time and so I gave them out at the  
5 NISA conference two years ago, before the pandemic.

6 MS. BUTTERFIELD: Yes. Go ahead.

7 MS. BROWN: This is Doreen. Thank you. I just  
8 want to say this is amazing. You guys did a really great  
9 job. And I -- NACIE has always tried to inform, but with  
10 this topic it not only took a great leap, a colossal leap  
11 is what I was saying when I was reading it, not just  
12 being informed but also to educate. And that's really  
13 powerful. So thank you, it looks great. It is great.

14 DR. JACKSON-DENNISON: Thank you.

15 DR. PAYMENT: Robin, will you sign a copy for me  
16 please as our chair?

17 (Laughter)

18 MS. BUTTERFIELD: Of course, Aaron. You need to  
19 sign it as well.

20 DR. PAYMENT: I'm going to sell it on Ebay.

21 DR. JACKSON-DENNISON: But you know what, the  
22 greatest thing about it. We're not just complaining or

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

1 whining, and saying do this, and do this, do this, do  
2 this. We're saying here's why, and here's how it  
3 connects to the real world that we live in. That's what  
4 it's really saying. Yes.

5 MS. BUTTERFIELD: Yes. So yes. So once we get  
6 this one done how soon do we start on the next one?

7 DR. JACKSON-DENNISON: I'm already getting some  
8 ideas in my head about the story too. I think we should  
9 highlight a story on someone's educational trauma, or  
10 educational -- historical trauma. Like I think about my  
11 dad's story. I'm sure there's plenty of other stories  
12 that you all have that you know of that should be told  
13 in this document as you're putting consultation up front,  
14 and you have right in there with a story or two about  
15 someone who's lived it. Yes.

16 (Simultaneous speaking)

17 MS. ENG: -- great to have more than one story in  
18 there. Like just mini stories throughout the document.  
19 I think that would really enhance some of the things.

20 And I was also thinking with some of the  
21 infrastructure maybe pictures as well.

22 DR. JACKSON-DENNISON: Oh, that would be good.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

1 MS. ENG: -- would be really good, and make it  
2 very strong. And I also wanted to say thank you for  
3 letting us -- having us along for the ride. You guys  
4 are doing such important work. I thank you so much for  
5 letting us be a part of this.

6 MS. BUTTERFIELD: We sure appreciate you, Shirley.

7 DR. JACKSON-DENNISON: We sure do. Yes.

8 MS. HERNANDEZ: Dr. Dennison and Shirley, this is  
9 Angela. I just want to call to your attention the  
10 question from Mandy, just a process clarification point.  
11 She's just asking after this meeting now will the  
12 subcommittee receive the latest version that you've just  
13 walked through here.

14 MS. ENG: Yes. I hope to have that out either  
15 later on -- well, it's already 3 o'clock. Probably first  
16 thing tomorrow morning. And then -- let me know. I  
17 mean, I can send the document out as it is now, and then  
18 we can work on the edits. Maybe that might be more  
19 efficient.

20 MS. HERNANDEZ: I think so. And it will give  
21 NACIE members more time because you're asking for their  
22 comments by noon tomorrow.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

1 MS. ENG: Yes, yes. Okay, I'll just send this  
2 out as soon as this meeting is over.

3 DR. JACKSON-DENNISON: Okay.

4 MS. BUTTERFIELD: Okay. And then any further  
5 comments should be done via email.

6 MS. ENG: Yes.

7 MS. BUTTERFIELD: And is that addressed to you  
8 again, Shirley?

9 MS. ENG: Yes. For efficiency yes, let's just  
10 keep the process the same.

11 MS. BUTTERFIELD: Okay.

12 MS. ENG: So just remember this is not a shared  
13 document. So if you make edits you have to attach the  
14 document to the email.

15 MS. BUTTERFIELD: Right, right. Is that all we  
16 have on our agenda then? We've got the next steps. Did  
17 you want to go over that, Dr. Dennison?

18 DR. JACKSON-DENNISON: I was just reading the  
19 chat. What was that? Go over next steps?

20 MS. BUTTERFIELD: I think we've done most of this.  
21 Yes, that's on the agenda. It just says review any  
22 edits, timeline. We did that. Transmit it to Secretary,

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

1 transmit it to Congress. We don't know those dates.

2 DR. JACKSON-DENNISON: No. We go through the --  
3 yes. Right in there, the 21st through the 23rd of  
4 December. And then it would go out. I'm not sure how  
5 it goes out. Usually I just get notified when it's been  
6 sent. That's usually how it works.

7 MS. HERNANDEZ: So our office will support  
8 transmitting it to -- meaning OIE will transmit it to  
9 the Office of Legislative and Congressional Affairs at  
10 the department, and it is that office, that division that  
11 sends it out to the members of Congress that you have  
12 listed in your annual report.

13 However, the transmittal to the Secretary of  
14 Education will need to come from you, Dr. Dennison. And  
15 I have a couple of templates that I'm putting together  
16 of letters so that that will be something that comes from  
17 you because it comes directly from NACIE and not from  
18 us.

19 DR. JACKSON-DENNISON: Okay. So, maybe the  
20 subcommittee could meet again after this -- maybe in  
21 January to go over the one that goes to the Secretary.

22 MS. ENG: Does it have to be -- does everything

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

1 have to be transmitted before the end of the year?

2 MS. HERNANDEZ: I know that was the ideal.

3 (Simultaneous speaking)

4 MS. BUTTERFIELD: -- in a time crunch.

5 DR. JACKSON-DENNISON: Okay. The subcommittee,  
6 when are you guys available before the 31st of December  
7 to transmit the Office of the Secretary, or to the  
8 Secretary directly? Both Secretaries as a matter of  
9 fact. Or actually all three Secretaries now.

10 DR. PAYMENT: Yes.

11 MS. BUTTERFIELD: That's a good point.

12 DR. PAYMENT: I'm going to be maximally available  
13 next week and the following week because a lot of people  
14 take vacation times but I don't.

15 MS. BUTTERFIELD: Yes, I'm pretty much around  
16 myself. Not on the 23rd though.

17 DR. JACKSON-DENNISON: Okay. We could do it  
18 anytime, yes. Between -- let's do it -- let's have a  
19 subcommittee meeting if everyone is available on the week  
20 of the 20th then. Because I'm off.

21 MS. BUTTERFIELD: Well, but I thought we've got  
22 to wait for the 508 remediation? How about the week of

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

1 the 27th?

2 DR. JACKSON-DENNISON: That's fine too. That's  
3 fine.

4 DR. PAYMENT: So just pick a time. I'm maximally  
5 available.

6 DR. JACKSON-DENNISON: How about the -- I don't  
7 like to do Monday because who knows after Christmas too.

8 MS. BUTTERFIELD: How about Tuesday?

9 DR. JACKSON-DENNISON: Tuesday works for me.

10 MS. BUTTERFIELD: And I'd prefer not to have to  
11 get up at the crack of dawn.

12 (Laughter)

13 MS. BUTTERFIELD: How about 10 o'clock Pacific  
14 time? That would be 1 o'clock.

15 MS. HERNANDEZ: 1 Eastern.

16 MS. BUTTERFIELD: 1 Eastern. Would that work?

17 MS. HERNANDEZ: On Tuesday the 28th?

18 MS. BUTTERFIELD: Yes.

19 MS. HERNANDEZ: Yes.

20 MR. LESSARD: Yes. Robin, my email will have an  
21 on annual leave automatic sendback, but I'll be able to  
22 join the meeting. That's not a problem.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

1 MS. BUTTERFIELD: Okay.

2 DR. JACKSON-DENNISON: Okay. Thank you, Ron.

3 MR. LESSARD: I had to use it or lose it so I had  
4 to kind of put in for it.

5 MS. HERNANDEZ: And Dr. Dennison and other  
6 subcommittee members, the purpose will be to, one, take  
7 a look at what is the final final version of the report,  
8 and in advance of that meeting I'll send a quick copy of  
9 the templates of the letters that would accompany those.  
10 And then you can -- if you want to adjust, edit, et  
11 cetera, you can feel free to do it during that time.  
12 Does that work?

13 MS. BUTTERFIELD: Yes.

14 DR. JACKSON-DENNISON: Yes.

15 MS. ENG: Can I interject a second? So after the  
16 20th we can't make any other edits to the document. So  
17 what I'm thinking is you could have the meeting on the  
18 20th and then go through what you want and when you want  
19 to send things. Yes, just assume -- after the 20th we  
20 can't make any additional edits.

21 (Simultaneous speaking)

22 DR. PAYMENT: That's a good catch.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

1 DR. JACKSON-DENNISON: I could do the 20th.

2 MS. BUTTERFIELD: Could we move the time though  
3 to 1, 1 Eastern on the 20th?

4 MS. HERNANDEZ: Yes.

5 DR. PAYMENT: Works for me.

6 MS. BUTTERFIELD: All right.

7 MS. ENG: And then there we can also get final -  
8 - I won't say approval, but a nod to the final report.  
9 The final edits. Because we'll probably send out the  
10 final final report sometime during the weekend, either  
11 late Saturday or early Sunday, so you'll have time to  
12 take a look at it.

13 DR. JACKSON-DENNISON: Okay.

14 MS. BUTTERFIELD: Monday the 20th at 1 p.m.  
15 Eastern.

16 MS. ENG: I'll send out this calendar too so you  
17 have it.

18 MS. BUTTERFIELD: Oh, okay, great.

19 (Simultaneous speaking)

20 MS. ENG: Sorry, I missed that.

21 (Simultaneous speaking)

22 PARTICIPANT: I heard the question, Shirley. I

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

1 will send this. We'll use the same one from the  
2 subcommittee that we've had the last six weeks or so.

3 DR. JACKSON-DENNISON: Okay.

4 PARTICIPANT: And I will -- will this be for  
5 everyone, all of the NACIE members that join this meeting  
6 on the 20th?

7 MS. HERNANDEZ: No, only the subcommittee members.  
8 We can't have all of the NACIE members, otherwise it's a  
9 public meeting.

10 PARTICIPANT: Okay, all right. I'll send a new  
11 invite for the 20th at 1 p.m. Eastern time.

12 MS. BUTTERFIELD: While we rarely get all the  
13 NACIE members. Throw that out there as a gentle  
14 reminder.

15 DR. JOHN: I'm back. I'm available on the 20th.

16 DR. PAYMENT: Hey, good to hear your voice.

17 DR. JACKSON-DENNISON: Okay, I think we're just  
18 about complete with everything then. Are there any other  
19 comments or questions?

20 MS. BUTTERFIELD: I'll just -- so when are we  
21 going to have a meeting of NACIE?

22 DR. PAYMENT: Oh yes.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

1 DR. JACKSON-DENNISON: A full meeting?

2 MS. BUTTERFIELD: Yes, a full meeting in general.

3 DR. JACKSON-DENNISON: I would think in January.  
4 January or February. Early in the year so we don't have  
5 crunch time again.

6 MS. BUTTERFIELD: Yes. A little, yes. We'll  
7 still be in a crunch time.

8 DR. JACKSON-DENNISON: Angela, could you --

9 MS. HERNANDEZ: I can certainly send out a few  
10 dates. I don't know if anybody knows just off the top  
11 of their heads right now whether there are any particular  
12 times or dates or weeks during January and February that  
13 would definitely be off the table because of other  
14 events.

15 MS. BUTTERFIELD: Thanks for asking. I'm going  
16 to have my left knee replaced on the 10th so give me a  
17 couple of weeks if you could.

18 MS. HERNANDEZ: Of January?

19 MS. BUTTERFIELD: Of January, yes.

20 MS. HERNANDEZ: That's not a good New Year's  
21 resolution, Robin.

22 MS. BUTTERFIELD: But down the road it might be

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

1 better.

2 MS. HERNANDEZ: True, true.

3 MS. BUTTERFIELD: It's not a good way to start  
4 off the year for sure.

5 DR. PAYMENT: Are we talking about in person or  
6 virtual?

7 MS. HERNANDEZ: Virtual.

8 DR. PAYMENT: Okay. Well, you could do it from  
9 your hospital bed. Come on.

10 (Laughter)

11 DR. PAYMENT: We're not asking you to run a  
12 marathon.

13 (Simultaneous speaking)

14 MS. BUTTERFIELD: -- not be doped up. That's all  
15 I'm asking.

16 DR. PAYMENT: Oh okay. You might be a little  
17 loopy.

18 MS. BUTTERFIELD: Might be a little loopy for a  
19 couple of days. So that would put us toward the end of  
20 the month.

21 DR. JACKSON-DENNISON: Maybe in February would be  
22 best. Give you some time to heal, and give us some time

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

1 to get the semester started with our different jobs.

2 DR. JOHN: Yes, I agree.

3 DR. JACKSON-DENNISON: Probably in February.

4 DR. PAYMENT: The first week maybe?

5 MR. LESSARD: So Aaron, is the -- the winter  
6 session NCAI is going to be in person, you think?

7 DR. PAYMENT: Yes. As of right now we think so.  
8 But you know the omicron variant may throw us for another  
9 loop.

10 MR. LESSARD: So that's the 13th through the 17th.

11 MS. BUTTERFIELD: And NIA is doing their Hill week  
12 in March. I think it's the second week. The fifth  
13 through the eighth or something like that.

14 MR. LESSARD: AIHEC usually has their board  
15 meeting -- actually they usually have it at the Holiday  
16 Inn across from the Department of Education in February.  
17 But they usually, I think they time that around the same  
18 time as the executive winter session.

19 DR. PAYMENT: Yes, you've got it on the 13th.

20 MR. LESSARD: Yes.

21 DR. PAYMENT: So maybe Ron and I and others who  
22 know of some of these meetings that would potentially

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

1 conflict could just send some of those dates like on a  
2 two-month calendar, January-February, and then we could  
3 Doodle poll for the times that are open.

4 MS. HERNANDEZ: That would be extremely helpful.  
5 Yes. You want to send any dates or significant -- for  
6 any of you.

7 DR. PAYMENT: I'll start like a PDF document that  
8 I'll circulate and then everybody could just add to it.

9 DR. JACKSON-DENNISON: Okay. That works.

10 DR. JOHN: My schedule is I teach Tuesdays and  
11 Thursdays, and I go until 8-9 at night, so I prefer  
12 Monday or Friday.

13 DR. PAYMENT: Monday or Friday. Hey Theresa, do  
14 you know Mike Williams?

15 DR. JOHN: I do.

16 DR. PAYMENT: He's in Florida right now. He's  
17 posting pictures of him getting a tan -- no, in Hawaii.

18 DR. JOHN: Oh. Yes, they're my distant relatives.  
19 He's always say my cousin, my cousin is here. Yes.

20 (Simultaneous speaking)

21 MS. BUTTERFIELD: Just to double check, the NIA  
22 will be in D.C. the weekend of February 14th.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

1 MR. LESSARD: Yes.

2 DR. PAYMENT: Oh, that's right when -- we have to  
3 get our schedules worked out between NIEA and NCAI. I'll  
4 work on that.

5 DR. JACKSON-DENNISON: Yes. It would be good if  
6 we could take this report out to the public at some point  
7 in a conference type session.

8 DR. PAYMENT: Yes.

9 DR. JACKSON-DENNISON: We kind of had an idea of  
10 doing that at NIEA but it didn't come together very good  
11 the last time. We just were there.

12 (Simultaneous speaking)

13 MS. BUTTERFIELD: -- together was at the 50th in  
14 Minneapolis when we -- the last time we did it.

15 (Simultaneous speaking)

16 DR. JACKSON-DENNISON: It would be good to do that  
17 and have that --

18 DR. PAYMENT: Robin, do you want to work on seeing  
19 if we can get that for the next NIEA and I'll work on  
20 the NCAI one.

21 MS. BUTTERFIELD: Oh sure, yes.

22 DR. PAYMENT: I'll get a conference session

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

1 breakout.

2 DR. JACKSON-DENNISON: Yes. I think the more we  
3 get it out there the more people will understand who  
4 NACIE is. That's another thing that I've learned is that  
5 people don't even know who NACIE is. And that's where -  
6 - we want to make it so -- I'm talking about the general  
7 Native educator out there doesn't know sometimes who  
8 NACIE is and what our purpose is. And so that's where  
9 we miss the boat too in getting information that is  
10 important into this report and then sharing it back out,  
11 that we're reporting this and then there's accountability  
12 in it where you can come back and say hey, what about  
13 this, or what about that, and we get more information.  
14 And that way. That's just my idea.

15 MS. BUTTERFIELD: And I agree, and I think that  
16 NACIE used to be able to hold listening sessions at these  
17 big events where we could get more grassroots  
18 recommendations if we missed something in the report.  
19 It would be helpful. So I think it is important.

20 DR. JACKSON-DENNISON: That's how we got a lot of  
21 this stuff, from -- this information that we do have was  
22 from those listening sessions that we held early on.

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

1 Yes.

2 MR. LESSARD: Yes.

3 MS. ENG: Dr. Dennison, you also talked about a  
4 logo for the report.

5 DR. JACKSON-DENNISON: Oh yes, okay. I'll send  
6 that to you. I still have it in my email. I'll send it  
7 to you. I think Robin might have commented back on the  
8 colors if I remember right.

9 MS. BUTTERFIELD: Why don't you send that out to  
10 the subcommittee.

11 DR. JACKSON-DENNISON: Okay, I will do that.

12 MS. BUTTERFIELD: And then Theresa, you know, you  
13 need to look at this report and make sure we're inclusive  
14 of Native Alaskan issues.

15 DR. JOHN: Okay.

16 MS. BUTTERFIELD: -- missed something.

17 DR. JOHN: Okay, I'll do that.

18 MS. BUTTERFIELD: Maybe you and Doreen could  
19 double check.

20 DR. JOHN: As you were talking about -- Dr.  
21 Dennison, about people not knowing who we really are or  
22 why we're here I think it would be a good idea to have

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

1       like Some sort of a write-up to share with education  
2       agencies or newsletters, or something like that.

3               MS. BUTTERFIELD: Well, there is that summary on  
4       that one page that Aaron did that talks about NACIE. You  
5       could just duplicate that.

6               DR. JOHN: Okay, that sounds good. I like that,  
7       thank you.

8               MS. BUTTERFIELD: Okie doke.

9               MR. LESSARD: I think it would be good when the  
10       report's finished maybe a media advisory or a press  
11       release from Secretary Cardona, or something along those  
12       lines where it takes it right to the level. Because the  
13       White House counsel will hear it, and if it goes out  
14       everywhere with the Secretary announcing the release of  
15       the report. Something, something that would raise it to  
16       that level and he can carry a copy with him everywhere  
17       he goes.

18               MS. BUTTERFIELD: That would be awesome.

19               DR. JACKSON-DENNISON: Yes.

20               MS. BUTTERFIELD: Same with Interior.

21               MR. LESSARD: Yes.

22               DR. JACKSON-DENNISON: Okay, I'm trying to look

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309

1 for that logo but I'll send it out as soon as I find it.

2 MS. BUTTERFIELD: If we're done I move we adjourn.

3 DR. JACKSON-DENNISON: Okay. Thank you. Second  
4 -- motion and second. All in favor say aye.

5 (Chorus of ayes)

6 DR. JOHN: Happy holidays.

7 DR. JACKSON-DENNISON: Happy holidays everyone.

8 MS. BUTTERFIELD: Happy holidays, everyone. Be  
9 safe.

10 MS. HERNANDEZ: Thank you everyone.

11 MR. LESSARD: Thank you, everyone.

12 (Whereupon, the above-entitled matter went off  
13 the record at 3:09 p.m.)

**NEAL R. GROSS**

COURT REPORTERS AND TRANSCRIBERS  
1716 14th STREET, N.W., SUITE 200  
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20009-4309